

**Ahmed Draia University – Adrar**

**Faculty of Letters and Languages**

**Department of English Letters and Language**



Hybrid identities in Post-9/11 writings: Ali Eteraz's *Native Believer*  
and Muhsin Hamid's *The Reluctant Fundamentalist*

**Dissertation Submitted in Partial Fulfilment of the Requirements for a  
Master's Degree in Literature and Civilization**

**Presented by:**

Boutheyna Hannani

**Supervised by:**

Mr. Ismail Djelouli

**Board of Examiners**

Ms. Hadjer Belhamidi

Mr. Abdelwahid Abidi

**Academic Year: 2020 – 2021**

الجمهورية الجزائرية الديمقراطية الشعبية  
République algérienne populaire et démocratique

وزارة التعليم العالي والبحث العلمي  
Ministère de l'enseignement supérieur et de la recherche scientifique

UNIVERSITE AHMED DRAYA - ADRAR  
BIBLIOTHÈQUE CENTRALE  
Service de recherche bibliographique  
N°.....B.C/S.R.B//U.A/2021

جامعة احمد دراية - ادرار  
لكتبة المركزية  
صلحة البحث البيولوجرافي  
لرقم.....م.م/م.ب.ب.ج/أ.ج 2021

## شهادة الترخيص بالإيداع

انا الأستاذ(ة): جلولي سماعيل

المشرف مذكرة الماستر.

الموسومة بـ: Hybrid Identities in Post-9/11 Writings  
Ali Etenaz's Native Believer and Mutisim Hamid's The Reluctant

Fundamentalist  
Hannami Bouthayma من إنجاز الطالب(ة):

و الطالب(ة):

كلية: الأدب واللغات

القسم: اللغة الانجليزية

التخصص: اداب وحضارة

تاريخ تقييم / مناقشة:

أشهد ان الطلبة قد قاموا بالتعديلات والتصحيحات المطلوبة من طرف لجنة التقييم / المناقشة، وان المطابقة بين  
النسخة الورقية والإلكترونية استوفت جميع شروطها.  
وبإمكانهم إيداع النسخ الورقية (02) والإلكترونية (PDF).

- امضاء المشرف:

08/07/21  
  
مستأذن رئيس قسم  
مستأذن رئيس قسم  
مستأذن رئيس قسم  
مستأذن رئيس قسم

ملاحظة: لا تقبل أي شهادة بدون التوقيع والمصادقة.

## **Dedication**

This dissertation is dedicated first and foremost to myself, who spent the last twenty years studying and dreaming of becoming who I am today. I never expected in a million year that I would arrive at this juncture of my life.

Every challenging work needs self efforts as well as guidance of elders especially those who are very close to our heart.

I dedicate My humble effort to my sweet and loving

Father & Mother

Who encouraged me to go on every adventure, especially this one. And whose affection, love, and prayers of day and night made me able to get such success and honor.

I dedicate this work to my dear brother Youcef, and my lovely sisters Salsabil, Ibtihal, and Amani.

I also dedicate this work to my big family, especially my beloved cousin Amina who encouraged me with her moral support throughout this long journey.

To all my friends and colleagues, I thank them for sharing the good and bad moments with me, and I thank them for their encouragement and support; Messaouda, Faiza, Latifa,

Ibtissem, Nawel Thank you.

To all those who love me.

## Acknowledgements

*“The great teacher makes a few simple points. The powerful teacher leaves one or two fundamental truths. And the memorable teacher makes the point not by telling but by helping the students discover on their own.”*

Professor Jacob Neusner

All praise is to Allah for giving me the strength, the audacity and the endurance to realize this work.

I would like to express my thanks to my supervisor, Mr. Ismail Djellouli for his guidance through this study. I am truly grateful for all his efforts in revising and correcting this paper.

I would like to express my deepest and sincere gratitude for Professor Aziz Mostefaoui for the thoughtful notes and the unfailing support all along my journey to make this humble work. I am truly grateful for his kindness and moral support.

A very special thank you is owed to Professor Fouad Mami, whose classes always inspired and fulfilled our expectations, he has always been so eager to give us all his knowledge, and we have always felt his energy and enthusiasm in class. I thank him for all his efforts and for being our memorable teacher.

I am grateful to Professor Fouzi Borsali, our caring and compassionate teacher for fostering the love of learning within us. I thank him for being always there for us.

I am thankful to the jury members who devoted their precious time and efforts in reading and correcting my work.

## **Abstract**

The object of this study is to examine elements of hybridity in two novels; Ali Eteraz' *Native Believer* and Muhsin Hamid' *The Reluctant Fundamentalist*. These two novels feature two protagonists who are either first-generation or second-generation Muslim migrants in the United States and are both of Pakistani descent. 9/11 plays a significant role in both novels, as this historical event marked a watershed moment in the lives of many Muslims in the United States and around the world. So I examine and analyze the various ways in which Pakistani Muslim migrants negotiate their hybrid identities as depicted in Muhsin Hamid's and Ali Eteraz's novels. I will analyse how 9/11 has altered the way Muslims are perceived, treated, and how they lived their lives in the light of that all. I will also examine how each one of them explore his identity and what he will end up doing as a result.

Keywords: identity, identity crisis, hybridity, Pakistanis muslims, 9/11, islam, Pakistan, The United States.

## Contents

Dedication.....	I
Acknowledgements.....	II
Abstract .....	III
Contents.....	IV
General Introduction .....	1
Background of the Study .....	1
Statement of the Problem .....	3
The Objective of the Study .....	5
The Scope of the Study.....	6
The Theoretical Framework .....	7
Literature Review .....	9
Chapter One: A Historical background .....	13
1.1 Political Islam .....	14
1.2 Media and its Contribution to the Non-Distinction between Islam and Islamism.....	15
1.3 Islam in the United States .....	18
1.4 The Events of 9/11 and Political Islam.....	21
1.5 The Events of 11 September and their Terrible Consequences on Muslims .....	22
1.6 The Ongoing Controversy and Identity Crisis among Muslim Americans .....	24
Chapter Two: Toward choosing an identity in <i>Native Believer</i> .....	28
Introduction.....	29
2.1 Protagonist M. Portraying Himself as an Alabama Southerner .....	30
2.2 M's Sexual Experiences and its Effects on his Sense of Belonging to America.....	34
2.3 The development of M's relationship with Islam .....	40
2.4 The Muslim Communities in the Novel .....	48
Chapter Three: The struggle for identity and the question of belonging in <i>The Reluctant Fundamentalist</i> .....	53
Introduction.....	54
3.1 Changez' Americanness in <i>The Reluctant Fundamentalist</i> .....	54
3.2 Unveiling the Protagonist's American Mask .....	59
3.3 The Question of Identity and Belonging .....	64
3.4 Asserting Muslim Identity .....	68

General Conclusion.....	70
Works cited.....	72

## **General Introduction**

### **Background of the Study**

Pakistani Muslims as migrants in the West have been the subject of many researches . The period since September 11, 2001, has seen large changes in the lives of the Pakistani Diaspora as a result of tightening immigration law and policy in the United States. After 9/11, the number of Pakistanis immigrants admitted to the United States fell by more than 40% (Naimal Fatima 5). A feature that precisely made a significant contribution to this change was when the government expanded the definition of "terrorist activity" to include a broader range of behaviors. As a result, non-US citizens of Pakistani origin were subjected to increased security checks. Besides that, public resentment resulted in mistreatment of those who had settled or were living in America, as well as those who were coming for tourism. Nonetheless, there has been no significant drop in the number of Pakistanis granted naturalized US citizenship, which could be due to the fact that citizenship was a multi-year process and changes in practice took longer to show up in the data.

It is essential to understand how Pakistanis Muslims immigrants negotiate their hybridized identities in order to understand how they define themselves and how they are defined by others. Muslims migrated to Europe and America in particular during the twentieth century, but the rate of these migrations increased after World War II. Stereotypes against Muslims existed long before the 9/11 incident, and there is even a term in cultural studies that covers this peculiar experience as Islamophobia, which implies dread or contempt of Islam and, thus, to despair and detest all or most Muslims. This paper focuses on Pakistani Muslims who have struggled to find their identity. Pakistani Muslim migrants demonstrate an imposed identity while negotiating their identities, and they become what they are not.



## General introduction

This background of Muslim Pakistanis immigrants in the United States is well reflected in Ali Eteraz's *Native Believer* (2016) and Muhsin Hamid's *The Reluctant Fundamentalist* (2007). To comprehend the novels in light of hybridity, one must first understand the authors and the content of the novels. Ali Eteraz is a freelance writer and journalist. He was born into a nomadic family in Lahore, Pakistan, and grew up in the Middle East, Pakistan, and the Caribbean, as well as ten American States. In college, he majored in philosophy and wrote his thesis on Nietzsche. Later, he attended law school, where he received a public service fellowship and interned on human rights cases. After a brief stint in corporate litigation, he transitioned to a writing career. He currently writes for The Guardian, True/Slant, and Dawn, Pakistan's largest and oldest English-language newspaper (Mohsin Hamid). His articles have appeared in a variety of publications, including Dissent, Foreign Policy, Parabola, Open Democracy, and Alternet, and have been linked to by hundreds of blogs, including the New York Times, The Atlantic, and Time Magazine. It is important to note that he returned to his home country as a teenager after moving to the United States, where he became the target of a mysterious abduction plot. He eventually escaped with the help of a military escort. In his new memoir, *Children of Dust*, Eteraz recounts his experiences growing up between cultures. He also wrote *Native Believer*.

About *Native Believer*, Lorraine Adams said "Ali Eteraz has written a hurricane of a novel. It blows open the secrets and longings of Muslim immigration to the West, sweeping us up in the drama of identity in ways newly raw. This is no poised and prettified tale; buckle in for a uproariously messy and revealing ride" (Ali Eteraz). The Oprah Magazine wrote "M.'s life spins out of control after his boss discovers a Qur'an in M.'s house during a party, in this wickedly funny Philadelphia picaresque about a secular Muslim's identity crisis in a country waging a never-ending war on terror." Ali Eteraz managed to write an

exceptional novel that received widespread praise. Likewise, Muhsin Hamid's novel was widely popular as well.

Mohsin Hamid was born in Lahore, Pakistan, in 1971, and moved to the United States at the age of 18 to attend Princeton University and Harvard Law School. He then worked as a management consultant in New York before returning to Lahore as a freelance journalist. In his daring, inventive work, the Pakistan-born international bestselling author of *Moth Smoke*, *The Reluctant Fundamentalist*, and *How to Get Filthy Rich in Rising Asia* tackles ethnic identity, class disparity, and mass-urbanization.

Mohsin Hamid has quickly emerged as a clarion voice of his generation, having won the Betty Trask Award, been a Pen/Hemingway finalist (Hamish Hamilton Ltd), and been shortlisted for the Man Booker twice, most recently for *Exit West*. *The Reluctant Fundamentalist* (2007) tells the story of a Pakistani man who left his high-flying life in New York. It became a million-copy international bestseller after being published in over 30 languages. It was nominated for the Man Booker Prize and won the Ambassador Book Award, the Anisfield-Wolf Book Award, the Asian American Literary Award, and the South Bank Show Award for Literature. It was named one of the books that defined the decade by The Guardian. Mira Nair's 2013 film adaptation of *The Reluctant Fundamentalist* starred Riz Ahmed, Liev Schreiber, Kate Hudson, and Kiefer Sutherland. The two authors were able to transfer all of their awareness of the peculiar state onto their novels as a result of their experience living between two cultures.

### **Statement of the Problem**

Everyone has heard of 9/11, but not everyone is aware of what it did to the Muslim community. Following the attack, all the world has discovered a new word which is Islamophobia. It only took a single day for millions of people to believe that all Muslims

were terrorists. Even though it was years ago, many good Muslims continued to face discrimination as a result of the way the media only focuses on the negative sides, and as a result of extremism and terrorist groups. It is the 9/11 stigma, in which one percent of a certain population is capable of causing the other 99 percent to suffer. As a result, Muslims who have migrated to western countries have been stigmatized. 9/11 contributed to the widespread perception that Muslim migrants are untrustworthy. Migrants are criticized, attacked, and viewed as dangerous outsiders in Western countries.

“Other,” a seemingly innocuous word, has a completely different meaning for those who identify with the regions represented by Other Collective, which include West Asia, Central Asia, South Asia, and North Africa, as well as their diaspora communities (Ingrid Rosenthal). To these people, the term "Other" conjures up images of forces that confine the identities. One literal example is how certain demographic surveys have grouped our numerous and diverse identities into a single neat category known as "some other race." It defines a region not because of its many distinct communities, but because it is not Western, Not the same, The polar opposite, Something else, an outsider and other. Edward Said's book *Orientalism*, in which he coined the term "Other," was a watershed moment in the evolution of "Other" identity, spawning a legacy that would forever alter academic thinking.

Edward Said criticizes how the West has portrayed Orientals by saying that Europe is the one who articulates the Orient; this is the prerogative of a genuine creator, whose life-giving power represents, animates, and constitutes the otherwise silent and dangerous space beyond familiar boundaries. The West accepts novels that have a negative point of view about islam and muslims ; yet, by being socially conscious and politically engaged in debates about their societies, contemporary novels written by Muslim authors are now decolonizing minds from styreotypes and providing a new way of thinking by writing about

the difficulties that the muslims are facing abroad, in other words they are writing about 9/11 from a muslim perspective.

Taking the attacks of September 11, 2001 on the World Trade Center in New York as a background, this dissertation aims to investigate how post-9/11 novels depict muslims in the United States, It will examine how the muslim protagonists in Ali Eteraz's *Native Believer* and Muhsin Hamid's *The Reluctant Fundamentalist* negotiate their hybrid identities in the United States of America, and the main problems they faced because of being muslims or of a muslim heritage, and will explore the decision they will eventually make based on what they encountered.

### **The Objective of the Study**

The primary goal of this paper is to examine and analyze the various ways in which Pakistani Muslim migrants negotiate their identities as depicted in Muhsin Hamid's and Ali Eteraz's novels. These two novels feature two protagonists who are either first-generation or second-generation Muslim migrants in the United States and are both of Pakistani descent. 9/11 plays a significant role in both novels, as this historical event marked a watershed moment in the lives of many Muslims in the United States and around the world. This event has altered the way Muslims are perceived, treated, and lived their lives. The novels I selected for my research depict two distinct Muslim experiences where the protagonists are influenced by their identity as Muslims living in post-9/11 America. However, what distinguishes them both is how they approach the given situation, so I will examine how each one of them explores his identity and what he will end up doing as a result.

Because the two protagonists have cultural heritage that differ from the culture of the environment in which they live, I want to work out the characteristics of hybrid identities using Bhabha's concept as the essence of the theoretical part of my thesis, I also want to shed

light on further opinions on Bhabha's theory and how it might have been optimized as well. Although this dissertation is a literary analysis, it seeks to investigate the political, sociological, and psychological factors influencing Pakistani Muslims' negotiation of their identities in an immigration context.

### **The Scope of the Study**

This research will look at the different experiences faced by Pakistanis muslims immigrants with reference to literary texts written by two Pakistanis muslim writers who lived between Pakistan and the United States themselves. It will reinforce the idea that they do not fit into either the host country's or their home countries' mainstream cultures. It aims to demonstrate how the two main characters feel isolated in a third space. A third space is defined by an in-betweenness created by the two men's 'otherness'. This third space is known as the hybrid space in post-colonial literature theory, and it emerges from the necessity of not belonging to either of the two already established sides. *The Reluctant Fundamentalist* by Mohsin Hamid and *Native Believer* by Ali Eteraz are suitable literary texts for study in this research as they help to better understand the conflict faced by Pakistanis muslims immigrants. The selection of these two novels will help giving different depictions of migrants negotiating their identities.

In *The Reluctant Fundamentalist*, Changez is unable to proceed his life in the United States after 9/11 owing to the hostility he feels from his fellow Americans and the mistreatment caused by US political acts and the media after 9/11. His longing for his native land, as well as the ongoing tensions between Pakistan and India since 9/11, are additional reasons why his mind is preoccupied with his native country rather than his life in the United States. As a result, he decides to leave his prestigious job in New York City and return to Lahore, Pakistan, after only four and a half years of living and studying in the United States.

M's identity, the protagonist of *Native Believer*, is also influenced by his Muslim background. Because the tragic event of 9/11 occurred several years before the story, it does not take an active role in the novel. However, there is Islamophobia in the novel, which arose as a result of 9/11 and is still being carried out.

Identity of the Pakistanis characters will be analyzed in both novels. Furthermore, I will also examine what the protagonists tried to do in order to belong. This research aims also to uncover some of major issues in the lives of muslim immigrants in the United States.

### **The Theoretical Framework**

Since the subjects of this study are two novels that talk about hybrid identities, it is important to present the scholar and critical theorist Homi Bhabha's notion of Hybridity and his critique of traditional cultural comprehension. For this purpose, I'll discuss selected chapters from his series of 12 essays, which have been collected in *The Location of Culture*. With postcolonial literature theory, this point of view on culture, As well as cultural differences, cultural margins, and cultural translation, has been revived and discussed from a different angle. These are all key points I'd like to talk about in this research, as I'm talking about how people's perceptions of culture are changing.

By analyzing Frantz Fanon's work on postcolonial identity, Bhabha questions identity. Fanon claimed that “decolonization is a necessary revolution because the greatest harm has been done on the global scale of colonialism” (Tronto 246). He argues in his book *Black Skin, White Masks* that the “Negro, however sincere, is the slave of the past” (Fanon, *Black Skin, White Masks* 225) and that he is unable to break free from this system. This system is the location he is placed in as a result of the act of colonialization. The colonizer and the colonized maintain a hierarchical relationship that is degrading and demeaning to the colonized person, who in Fanon's case is the person of color, or as he refers to him, the

"Negro." The colonizer, who imposes his culture on him, is responsible for the structural exploitation of the black man. The way the colonizer pushes his culture on the colonized is analogous to how culture has developed throughout history. Bhabha argues that "cultures come to be represented by virtue of the processes of iteration and translation through which their meanings are very vicariously addressed to through an Other" ( Bhabha *The Location of Culture* 83). As a result, any culture on the planet is a clone of an earlier one in some way. We cannot presume that a society is fully real in all aspects. However, the development of civilization in a classical context is not as enforcing as it is in a western context.

A colonized person must constantly be aware of his image, jealously protect his position .... The defenses of the colonized are tuned like anxious antennae waiting to pick up the hostile signals of a racially divided world. In the process, the colonized acquire a peculiar visceral intelligence dedicated to the survival of body and spirit. (Bhabha, *Forward: The Wretched of the Earth* ix)

What Bhabha explains in the quote above is colonial imperialism. Although European monarchies were largely inspired by the geographical and financial expansion of their monarchies, it was also planned that their culture and religion spread. As a result, during the colonial era, there was suppression of the colonized land's culture and introduction of the colonizer's culture. This strategy by the colonizing force expresses an unfiltered view of the colonized. The colonial forces oppress the native populations of colonized lands in a blatant way. Fanon "found a similar structure in anti-Semitism and racism, and other forms of exploitation: the key characteristic of exploitation is that it denies another's humanity" (Tronto 249). After being denied their own civilization, which is an essential part of their personality, the aboriginal people were effectively stripped of the life they desired. Fanon rejects the idea that European civilization is preferable from less evolved cultures in Africa and Central America. "When I look for man in European lifestyles and technology I see a constant denial of man, an avalanche of murders" (Fanon, *The Wretched of the Earth* 236).

Physically, the invaders slaughtered the indigenous peoples of the land they occupied, and psychologically, they annihilated their culture. Along with assistance of a “perverted logic, ... colonialism turns its attention to the past of the colonized people and distorts it, disfigures it, and destroys it” (Fanon, *The Wretched of the Earth* 149) During this point of siege, the colonized human lives under a delusion that leads him to conclude that the modern civilization being forced on him is more aspirational than his own. Fanon's idea for the decolonization stage is “to end all the distortions of human life and perversions of human psychology that arise out of colonialism” (Tronto 249), as a result.

In *The Location of Culture*, Bhabha discusses several facets of postcolonial literature studies, but as I discussed above, I want to concentrate on the issues that are important to my research, so I will limit myself to hybridity-related topics.

## Literature Review

Mohsin Hamid and Ali Eteraz are among the best Pakistani writers who wrote English novels, their novels, *the reluctant fundamentalist* and *native believer* are two of the bestselling novels in Pakistan and in the rest of the world. Before analyzing how the two protagonists explore their identities in *the reluctant fundamentalist* and *native believer*, it is important to know that these novels have previously been examined. Compared to *native believer*, there are more reviews on *the reluctant fundamentalist*. There are quite a number of scholarly articles on Mohsin Hamid's novel. On the other hand, Ali Eteraz's novel has not been given the same attention and there are few reviews.

In her essay ‘Moving through America: Race, place and resistance in Mohsin Hamid's *The Reluctant Fundamentalist*’, Anna Hartnell states that *The Reluctant Fundamentalist* provides a commentary on post 9/11 America and the inevitably transnational nature of its internal debate about multiculturalism. In addition, the novel offers a comment on the



introspective tendencies of the post-9/11 novel itself, which, as many critics have pointed out, have tended to “sublimate contemporary anxieties about state activity, and about the state's jeopardising of the safety of its citizens, in stories about the failures of family members to protect one another” (Holloway 108). She argues that “while *The Reluctant Fundamentalist* critiques the melting pot conception of American society in its manifestations both before and after 9/11, it also insists on a shared vision of society that eludes many accounts of multiculturalism.”

Peter Morey wrote in his essay “The rules of the game have changed” Mohsin Hamid’s *The Reluctant Fundamentalist* and post-9/11 fiction” that “initial fictional responses to 9/11 often took the form either of “trauma narratives”, attempting to trace the psychological scarring and mental realignments of characters caught up in the Twin Towers attacks, or semi-fictionalized “Muslim misery memoirs” which often served to underscore the injustices of Islamic rule and justify neoconservative interventionism. Against this backdrop”, Mohsin Hamid’s *The Reluctant Fundamentalist* (2007) represents “a sly intervention that destabilizes the dominant categories of the post-9/11 novel, undercutting the impulse to national normalization through the experience of its protagonist, Changez, and his journey from fully interpellated capitalist “fundamentalist” and “post-political” transnational subject to racially profiled object of suspicion and finally anti-American firebrand.” (Cultures in Movement 16)

In his article, ‘Out of the Concentration Camp’: Towards Fluid Identities for Muslims in Ali Eteraz’s *Native Believer*, Fouad Mami wrote : “In considering Eteraz’s overall approach to defusing the antagonism from 9/11, suffice it to outline that the presumed two players in the antagonism should be viewed as one. Proponents of Muslim fundamentalism, both locally and internationally, have a vested interest in retaining and massively circulating a fossilized block of the faith.”

## General introduction

Library Journal published “In bitingly funny prose, first novelist Eteraz (known for his memoir, *Children of Dust*) sums up the pain and contradictions of an American not wanting to be categorized; the ending is a bang-up surprise.” New York Times Book Review wrote:

In reviewing books I am often drawn to wonder why a publisher selected this or that author for publication. In too many cases, the question is unanswerable. In the case of *Native Believer*, it is crystal clear. Ali Eteraz is a master storyteller. *Native Believer* brings out the angst of a population caught between world events and assimilation into a fear-ridden culture. It is to Eteraz’s credit that he is unapologetic, and nods in admiration to those immigrants who have come before. Believer or non-believer, you won’t look at the local mosque the same after reading this excellent work. (12)

The New York Times Book Review wrote “Native Believer stands as an important contribution to American literary culture: a book quite unlike any I’ve read in recent memory, which uses its characters to explore questions vital to our continuing national discourse around Islam.”

This paper will explore how these novels went beyond representing fundamentalism, the American dream, the complex issues of Islam, or religious discrimination, and investigates the psychological, social, political and economic dimensions of the experiences of muslim Pakistanis Americans by questioning their identities and belonging.

**Chapter One**  
**A Historical background**

## **1.1 Political Islam**

Political Islam is a political and media term used to describe political change movements that believe in Islam as a life course, and used extensively after the events of September 11, 2001. And this term was frequently used in the propaganda campaign of what was called the War on Terror. According to Muslims, the use of the term derives from a lack of understanding and depth in the philosophy of Islam. Historically, Islam is the only religion that, during its initial spread, was able to form the nucleus of social, service and political institutions, both internally and externally, as opposed to other religions whose founders were unable to form the beginnings of a state (Adam Zeidan).

Political Islam in the Western sense can be defined as a set of political ideas and objectives emanating from Islamic law and used by a group called by Western media "radical Muslims," who believe that Islam is not only a religion, but also a political, social, legal and economic system suitable for building State institutions. Opponents of Islamic movements accuse these movements of somehow trying to restructure states and applying the analysis of Islamic sharia. The idea of applying Islamic law strictly in politics is not accepted by people that call themselves liberalists or what are sometimes called secular movements. Despite criticism and security and media campaigns against them, the movements of political Islam have been able to become the largest and most powerful political force on the Arab world (Adam Zeidan).

Despite the existence of states, governments, empires and mini-states in history that were based in their internal administration and political orientations on Islamic law, but the movement of political Islam in its modern sense began after the collapse of the Ottoman Empire after the First World War and Mustafa Kemal Ataturk established the Republic of Turkey in the European style and abolished the concept of the Islamic caliphate in March 3,

1924(Mohammed Al Sinou), moreover who abolished Islamic law from the legislative establishment and also carried out a liquidation campaign against many religious figures and conservatives. The ideas that the application of the religion of Islam is in retreat and that there is a setback in the Islamic world began to spread, especially after the fall of many Muslim countries under the mandate of the victorious Western countries in the First World War (Halim Rane and Audrey Courty).

The term Islamic Fundamentalism is one of the oldest terms used to describe what is today called political Islam. In September 1994, an international conference was held in Washington in the United States under the name "The Danger of Fundamentalist Islam to North Africa." The conference was about Sudan and what the conference described as 'Iran's attempt to spread the Islamic Revolution to Africa via Sudan'. Gradually after that, in the 1990s, and in the midst of the internal events in Algeria, this term was replaced by the term "radical Islamists", and then the term stabilized after the events of September 11, 2001, on political Islam (Halim Rane and Audrey Courty).

## **1.2 Media and its Contribution to the Non-Distinction between Islam and Islamism**

Islam has been at the center of discussions about social cohesion and national security in Western countries since the 9/11 attacks in the United States. Since then, there have been several public debates about the necessity of imposing restrictions on Muslim immigration, the most recent of which was Senator Fraser Anning's speech to the Australian Parliament. Today, many believe that future terrorist attacks in the name of Islam are inevitable. In light of this reality, media plays a fundamental role in how we perceive Islam and how we respond to it as a religion. However, due to a limited understanding of Islam, or a fear of antagonizing Muslims, a fundamental point is largely absent from media reports which is

The threat of terrorism does not stem from Islam, but rather stems from Islamism as a political ideology (Halim Rane and Audrey Courty).

Islamic groups such as Al Qaeda and the Islamic State use violence against non-Muslims with the aim of establishing a political institution called the “Caliphate,” without actually relying on the Qur’an and hadith. The appeals of militant Islamist groups are based on the selective use of Islamic teachings and their recombination as a legitimate religious commitment package. The Islamists confiscated the concept of "jihad" from the Islamic religion, with the aim of legitimizing an offensive "holy war" against non-Muslims. Of course, this interpretation has been rejected by researchers who have studied all of the principles of the Qur’an relating to war and peace (E. Shepard et al. 2009). For example, Islamic teachings clearly rejected the practice of terrorism and the use of violence against civilians, and this is why Muslim scholars around the world have condemned terrorism and issued ‘fatwas’ on many occasions. Unfortunately, Western media are spreading misleading interpretations of jihad, and downplaying the condemnations and fatwas echoed by moderate Muslim scholars, thus reinforcing the perceived link between Islam and terrorism (GREG NOAKES).

In some cases, some media critics explicitly create this connection, by suggesting that terrorists rely on Islam as the basis for their violent actions. Accepting terrorist allegations in such an easy way would distort the image of Islam and inadvertently legitimize the Islamists' actions. In other words, the media serve terrorists by allowing them to represent Islam and Muslims in general. Islamist terrorists have a strategic interest in spreading the mistaken belief that Islam and the West are engaged in a cultural war. For example, ISIS explained in its online magazine in 2015 that “Muslims in the West will soon find themselves between two options: either apostasy and infidelity, or immigration to the Islamic State, and thus escape from the persecution of the Crusaders.” (GREG NOAKES)

Radical Islamic groups rely on a strategy of “divide and rule” in order to recruit strangers into their ranks. Therefore, we find them targeting marginalized and disaffected Western Muslims, and they cite an Islamist narrative mixed with promises of brotherhood, security, and belonging. On the other hand, Western media are working indirectly to promote the interests of militant Islamic organizations by linking Muslim societies with terrorism, as a result of their failure to distinguish between the Islamic religion and the Islamist political ideology. For example, when the first wave of Syrian refugees arrived in the United Kingdom in 2015, the Daily Mail newspaper warned of "the deadly threat to Britain's enemy from within," and linked the refugees with Islamic extremists. This kind of reckless, inflammatory media coverage serves the goals of Islamist movements by pitting Muslims and non-Muslims against each other. According to a study conducted at the University of Vienna in 2017, media coverage that does not explicitly discriminate between Islamist Muslims fuels hostile attitudes toward the Muslim population in general (Halim Rane and Audrey Courty).

With the increasing awareness of the impact of this type of reporting, some media outlets - such as (CNN) - tried to distinguish between "moderate Islam" and "radical Islam" on the one hand, and "Islam" and "Islamic extremism" on the other hand. But these endeavors did not succeed because they focused on religious motives and ignored the central role of Islamist political ideology. In this regard, a study conducted by the "Counter-Terrorism Center" revealed that 85% of the elements of militant Islamist groups have not received any formal religious education throughout their lives, and this confirms the lack of religious awareness among Islamist activists, and their reliance on a purely political ideology, and thus their inability to Critical religious scrutiny of Islamist ideology and the jihadist narrative. Those who read deeply will know that Islamism is hiding behind the mantle of religion, and that it contains more political demands than it pursues the teachings

of the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH). It is true that Islamists declare the pursuit of establishing a caliphate or a system based on Sharia, but their ultimate goals do not deceive specialized researchers (Halim Rane and Audrey Courty).

In an attempt to strip Islamist organizations of their legitimacy, some British-French media outlets tried to use a different language, such as the word “ISIS” instead of “Islamic State,” but this practice is not done normally. Also, Australian politician Malcolm Turnbull adopted the term “Islamist terrorism”, in order to differentiate between those who adhere to an extremist Islamist ideology and those who belong to common Muslim societies. But many politicians - like Donald Trump - continue to blur this distinction (Halim Rane and Audrey Courty).

Those who think that the problem stems from Islam are mistaken, and a constructive dialogue about the basic concepts of Islam must be conducted, in order to reveal the clear truth: that Islam rejects the establishment of a “caliphate” by committing violence against non-Muslims, or even talking about a system based on Sharia, by forging a package of religious obligations aimed at providing its owners with religious legitimacy among the people. Considering the extent to which fears about Islam affect western societies, everyone has a moral obligation to distinguish between Islam and Islamism, or at the very least to confront the dubious Islamist perspective (Halim Rane and Audrey Courty).

### **1.3Islam in the United States**

Perhaps the most visible role of Islam in America in the era of the Founding Fathers is exemplified by the words and actions of the founders themselves, who sought, intentionally, to integrate Islam while establishing the principles of religious freedom (Jennifer Williams).



James Hutson, head of the manuscript division of the American Library of Congress, said “The early founders of America, clearly, incorporated Islam into their vision of the future of the republic. Freedom of religion, as the founders envisioned it, included Islam.”

As for Thomas Jefferson, who was famous for possessing a copy of the Qur’an, spoke about the role of Islam in America while campaigning for religious freedom in Virginia, and demanded for "recognition of what is called religious rights of the Mohammedans, Jews and pagans."

Even the issue of a Muslim running the presidency of the United States - an issue that surfaced recently when Republican presidential candidate Ben Carson said he “does not favor putting a Muslim in the leadership of the nation” (Yahia Ahmed) - was something the founding fathers discussed when they ratified the US Constitution.

In the early years of America's creation, the overwhelming majority of Muslims weren't inhabitants, but slaves. Researcher Richard Brent Turner explains that researchers differ on the number of Muslim slaves brought to the Americas, ranging from 40,000 (in the United States alone) to three million in North and South America and the Caribbean.

Historian Campezo Janabasiri, whose book “*History of Islam in America*” is one of the most comprehensive books on the subject, says that Muslims who lived in America's colonial period and the period before the civil war came from a range of different ethnic, educational, and economic backgrounds. Their experiences in America varied according to the time in which they were transferred to America, and the place they were transferred to, but \_he continue, Although many African Muslims tried to preserve their Islamic identities and cultures when they arrived in America, they needed to adapt to their new environment and form new societies. This eventually led to nearly all of them converting to Christianity. Which means that despite the huge influx of Muslims through the transatlantic slave trade,

Islam had disappeared from among these societies by the end of the nineteenth century(Jennifer Williams).

At the same time that Islam was fading from slave and ex-slave societies, millions of immigrants began arriving on the shores of America by the end of the nineteenth century, and especially in the beginning of the twentieth century. These numbers of immigrants included tens of thousands of Muslim-majority countries citizens who came from the Middle East, South and Central Asia, and Eastern Europe. This migration was stimulated, in part, by the industrial revolution that broke out as soon as America finally emerged from the rubble of the Civil War and the Reconstruction Era (Jennifer Williams).

The early twentieth century saw the beginning of the formation of Muslim immigrants into small organizations from local communities throughout the country. At this time, Howell writes, African Americans also began converting to Islam in the 1920s and 1930s, in response to the radical and racist persecutions that they faced before and during the Great Migration (the migration of disenfranchised Southerners to industrial areas in the North) (Jennifer Williams).

In 1924, the US Congress passed the National Origins Act, which restricted immigration from Asia and other Muslim regions, and thus stopped the flow of Muslim arrivals. But as the twentieth century progressed, Muslims who had already reached American shores, along with African Americans who had converted to Islam (or in some cases reconnected with their long-lost Muslim roots), began to play a much more active role in American politics and American society (Jennifer Williams).

As a result of the 1965 Immigration and Naturalization Act, more than 1.1 million Muslims may have arrived in the United States before the end of the twentieth century. Not all of these immigrants were religious, but their educational and cultural capabilities pushed

them to leadership positions (a large number of them were academics, doctors, and engineers) among the newly established Muslim immigrant groups (Jennifer Williams).

#### **1.4 The Events of 9/11 and Political Islam**

After the events of September 11, 2001, the American administration, led by US President George W. Bush found a way to limit the spread of so-called political Islam, so the United States declared a war on controversial terrorism, which some believe that in one way or another has led to an increase in the spread of political Islam thought, as these ideas spread in countries that previously followed a secular approach, such as Iraq, where ideas began. Political Islam appeared after the invasion of Iraq in 2003, and the Chechen file with the Russian Federation began to take a more violent character, and some republics of the former Soviet Union became showing Islamic features on their governments such as Uzbekistan, Kazakhstan, Turkestman and Azerbaijan . US President George W. Bush said that economic reform in the Islamic world is an important factor in winning the so-called war on terror, but this reform appears to be very slow in the arenas of the so-called war on terror in Afghanistan and Iraq (Aicha Lemsine).

After the events of September 11, 2001 also, the world media turned their attention towards political movements that take Islam as a source for drawing the outlines of their policies, and during this critical period a kind of chaos occurred in the analysis that led one way or another to not distinguish between Islam as a major religion and certain groups that take some of the jurisprudence Interpretation and application of Islamic law as a basis for it. This lack of focus has led to the spread of some concepts whose effects are still evident to this day of generalization used by a minority in the Western world towards the Islamic world, as they pose a threat to the Western way of life and interaction (Aicha Lemsine).

Most Western political analysts believe that the emergence of the phenomenon of political Islam is due to the low economic level of most countries in the Islamic world. Since the forties, some socialist movements began in some Islamic countries under the influence of communist thought as an attempt to raise the economic and social level of individuals, but the collapse of the Soviet Union left an intellectual void in the field of attempting economic and social reform. Analysts believe that from here the ideas that explained the backwardness and deterioration in the economic and social level began to move Muslims away from the correct application of the texts of Islamic law and blamed their governments for being influenced by Western policies. The Palestinian case, the Arab-Israeli conflict and the Israeli occupation of the West Bank of Gaza, and their accruing with the Islamic revolution in Iran and the second Gulf War paved the way for the emergence of the idea that Western policies are unfair towards Muslims (Aicha Lemsine)

Some American specialists in the affairs of Islam, such as Robert Spencer, believe that there is no difference between Islam and political Islam and that it is illogical to separate them. Islam, in his view, carries in its principles political goals, and Spencer said that Islam is not just a religion for Muslims, but rather a method and a way of life. It contains instructions and orders from the simplest activities such as eating and drinking to the most complex spiritual matters (Aicha Lemsine), This misunderstanding of islam and muslims had a serious consequences the muslims in the US.

### **1.5 The Events of 11 September and their Terrible Consequences on Muslims**

Years have passed since the events of September 11th, that terrorist crime against thousands of innocent american civilians and against humanity, That terrible accident that shook the world and changed its course and caused it to be between the two most brutal

terrorist forces of the world, The strength of American terrorism and the heinous violations that they are practicing against mankind under the pretext of fighting terrorism, which is basically a strategy to create terrorism in the first place on the one hand, And between the extremist Islamic terrorism, which only understands the language of murder, violence, destruction and beheadings on the other hand (Jennifer Williams).

The terrorist attacks of Sept. 11, 2001, were a watershed moment within the history of Islam in America. These attacks, carried out by extremists in the name of Islam, were the largest attack on American soil since the attack on Pearl Harbor in 1941. These attacks changed the nature of Muslim relations in the United States, and opened a debate that is still ongoing, about the acceptance of Muslim Americans as Equal citizens (Jennifer Williams).

Unfortunately, this growing appetite for learning about Islam has opened the door to the rise of the "Islamophobia industry," as it is sometimes called. People with anti-Muslim characters published books, quasi-academic journals, and articles, created websites, blogs, and non-profit "research" institutions, and appeared on news channels to spread the "truth" of Islam, which they presented as a violent, sinister, and un-American religion. Although these people claim to be "experts" in Islam, they usually present a highly biased picture and inaccurate information to the audience, who has often been drawn by this presentation to outright fanaticism and conspiracy theories.

It is noteworthy that 55% of Americans adopt negative attitudes towards Islam and Muslims, according to a survey conducted by the YouGov Foundation for Public Opinion and Information Research in 2015. Although Islamophobia existed before the September events, the events exacerbated and exacerbated them, and reintegrated the word Muslim within the phobia system.

The feelings of the average citizen towards the muslims are not positive, but the political leadership is perfecting the work of benefiting from muslim countries and from the economic interests achieved from relations with the muslims and at the same time preserving the image of the fearful muslim, and this has continued since the events of September 11, 2001, these events may have been the spark that brought Islamophobia back to the fore, but a series of events that followed kept it alive and added the Muslim dimension to it so that the American community looks at everything that is Muslim with suspicion.

### **1.6 The Ongoing Controversy and Identity Crisis among Muslim Americans**

First of all, I find it important to define what is an identity and what is an identity crisis, According to Merriam Webster's dictionary identity is 'a set of personal qualities by which a person is known as a member of a certain group', while identity crisis is personal psychosocial conflict especially in adolescence that involves confusion about one's social role and often a sense of loss of continuity to one's personality. And according to Collins Dictionary of Sociology "identity is the qualities, beliefs, personality, looks and/or expressions that make a person (self-identity as emphasized in psychology) (Jonathan M Cheek 341), or group (collective identity as pre-eminent in sociology), One can regard the awareness and the categorizing of identity as positive (Julie Smart 86) or as destructive (Paul James 174–195)." While an identity crisis "is a state in which a person experiences uncertainty about who they really are and their proper role in life."

An identity crisis, according to psychologist Eric Erikson, is a failure to fulfill a teenage ego identity. The stage of psychological development in which an identity crisis can occur is called the stage of confusion of identity versus role-adhesion. In that stage (adolescence), people are experiencing psychological development, sexual maturity, the

integrity of our thoughts about ourselves and about what other people think of us. Thus, we are building a self-image and carrying out the task of solving our basic ego identity crisis. The successful solution to the crisis depends on the person's progress through previous developmental stages, and an emphasis on confidence, independence, and initiative.

Just as the human being has an identity, society and nations have it also, There is an Islamic society, a secular society, and there is a Christian, a communist and also a capitalist society ... etc. and each of them has its own characteristics, values and principles. If the identity of the individual coincides with the identity of his community, then there is security, comfort, and a sense of belonging, but if identities clash, then the crisis and alienation begin, and that what Muslims in America face.

Despite the alienation, the US is home to many young Muslims who try to balance between traditional Islamic culture and the culture of the secular society in which they live. They are "hybrids" formed by two opposing forces that construct their identities. Being Muslim in the United States of America necessarily means that you move between multiple identities and to have to deal with them. So it is very important to understand that the identity crisis is a decisive component of the attempts of Muslims to “belong” to society in their own way. This implies the will to distinguish oneself through an assertive identity, separate from negative attitudes of previous generations, and separate from the traditional family identity (Jennifer Williams).

The journalist Emma Green believes that America usually offers Muslim youths two discordant paths, on the one hand there are people like President Donald Trump who post tweets with undocumented videos; With the aim of confirming the allegations and fabrications of violence by Muslims, they utter expressions unconnectedly, such as “I think Islam hates us,” and claim that “there is no real integration” between the second and third

generation of Muslims in the United States of America, while on the other side there are other people whose behavior is similar to The characters of "The Big Sick", the biographical film that depicts the love story of "Kumil Nanjiani", the Muslim comedian who rejects religion and falls in love with a white woman; what destroyed his immigrant family. most Muslims are located in an intermediate area between the two roads, Muslims in America, specifically 60%, who are less than forty years old, go through a fundamental Americanization process, which consists in experiencing various new identities, and self-established in their faith, ranging from complete secularism to Extreme religiosity, and although these features may be specific and determined to the Muslim community in America, they are also common to young people from other religions, such as Catholics, Jews, and even Puritan, however, Muslims create distinctive American styles through their religion (Jennifer Williams).

Muslims as a group are diverse, and their experiences reflect that extreme diversity. Some young Muslims care about their religion, culture and identity very deeply, but at the same time they choose to give other aspects of their lives priority over religion, while other people identify new, unconventional ways to stay connected to their faith, immigrants understand America somewhat differently from others who have lived in America long ago. Black Muslims faced a distinct kind of racial discrimination and had special sectarian societal needs (Jennifer Williams).

Being a diverse group, and struggling to define their identities and place in American society. Muslim Americans have not been limited to the rejection of terrorism and violence and their acceptance by non-Muslims only. The same conversations about identity, sexuality, values, and inclusion that the rest of American society had been busy with for decades were also taking place within American Muslim communities.



New Muslim subcultures developed, especially in the mid-2000, in part because the Internet and social media enabled people with common interests to communicate much more easily than ever before. Zain Abdullah wrote:

“Groups like the Progressive Muslims Union, that operated from 2004 to 2006, and Muslims for Progressive Values, established a web presence. The gay, bisexual, and transgender Muslim community became more present, and added a voice to the debate on Islamic authenticity. Members of these groups challenged the tendency to limit Muslim family life to heterosexuality. The Al-Fatiha Foundation was established in 1998 in New York, in response to the needs of gay, bisexual, and transgender Muslims.” ( Zain Abdullah)

Michael Muhammad Knight, a white American who converted to Islam at the age of 16 after reading the autobiography of Malcolm X, and spent two months studying Islam at the Faisal Mosque in Islamabad, in Pakistan - wrote a book which talk about a fictional story entitled "The Taqwa Corps" in which he discuss features of the search for identity among American Muslim communities in which he said:

“A home for rebellious Muslims (bank) in Buffalo, New York, inhabited by rebellious girls in burqaa, Mohawk-style Sufis, straight Sunnis, shaved heads, Indonesian skiers, rude Sudanese boys, gay Muslims, drunk Muslims, and feminists. Their living room hosts parties and prayers, and there is a hole in the wall to indicate the direction of the qibla. Their lives are mixed with sex, drugs, and religion in almost equal quantities, expressed by devotion to the rebellious Islamic subculture (punk). ” (Michael Muhammad Knight 23)

This book, which began with self-help and spread in the beginning through hand-copy copies, became a manifesto for the Muslims (banks), and represented the gospel of the rebellious youth. When Knight wrote his book, there was no such thing as a "taqi corp", Knight made this word up. But to his surprise, it became clear that the book, and the movie on which he was based expressed thousands of Muslim youths in America and abroad, and those young men saw themselves and their Islam reflected in the fictional lives of Knight's characters. Taqwa corps has become a real thing, and that's what was clear in Eteraz's novel *Native Believer* and Mohsin Hamid's *The Reluctant Fundamentalists*.

## **Chapter Two**

### **Toward choosing an identity in *Native Believer***

## Introduction

The insecurity of identities is a notable feature of our time. Muslims in general are aware of a single home and culture, but Muslims in Diaspora are aware of at least two. This chapter will investigate those dimensions by looking at how the political and social dimensions of the tragic event 9/11 have been brought up for discussion on a personal level. I argue that Mister M, the principal character of *Native Believer*, is strongly affected by the space in which he exists and that the ways in which place and time shape M's sense of identity remain central for the understanding of the novel. M is influenced by the fact that he is of Muslim origin, but he has no other native country to long for and call "home," which is one possible reason why he decides to pursue a fulfilled life in the United States.

This chapter proceeds through the themes that I found central in the writer's cultural project. Characters are mere instruments of the author's preoccupations and as such themes will allow me to explore the novel deeply, and to draw a thorough analysis, since one of the main aims of this dissertation is to show the struggling experience. First I will focus on M considering himself as American as an apple pie, and the struggling that he endured because of his Muslim heritage, I will analyze the reasons for his firing, as well as the consequences of the firing on him. Then I will analyze his relationship with Islam and finally the relationship with his wife and other females and his longing to have children, and what it means to him to bring children to America. Secondly, I will explore M's rebelliousness against restricted norms and I will investigate how these behaviors are related to his intention to be accepted in the United States, and whether he ends up being successful or not, and what identity he will choose to himself. M's negotiations between the Muslim and

the American world will be investigated also as the character's attempts to deal with the two sides of his hybrid identity which will be analyzed too.

## **2.1 Protagonist M. Portraying Himself as an Alabama Southerner**

*Native believer* is a novel told from the perspective of mister M, the protagonist. Mister m starts telling his story which began from the night in which he hosted a dinner party in his apartment in Philadelphia. The horrific tragedy of 9/11 is not depicted in the novel because it takes place much later than that date. M invited to the party his colleagues from the firm plutus communications, on the honor of the arrival of a new boss, George Gabriel, who was sent from New York. M organizes the party for the sake of impressing George Gabriel, he serves “prosciutto palmiers, braised ram shanks, and bull-tail stew” (7), which are made of pork that is not halal, in addition to the cheval blanc which is not halal also.

M, whose name we don't know, and it is never mentioned in the novel, goes by this abbreviation whenever he is asked about his name, mainly because his full name straightforwardly infers his Muslim root, as his spouse Marie-Anne later says in the novel. His wife Marie-Anne isn't a Muslim, like M himself, who confirms not to be “Muslim” (54) afterward within the novel. M told his wife that he wanted her to open the door for his boss when he arrives, because he wants her to be the one George Gabriel saw upon entry first. Since the aim of the party is impressing the boss, mister M thinks that his American wife opening the door will definitely leave a good impression.

In the first communication George Gabriel has with Marie-Anne, he complains regarding the restaurant figs that's set at the art deposit space, where M and Marie-Anne live. George's criticism isn't regarding the restaurant's quality; however, it claiming to be Mediterranean, once it's really serving Moroccan food He thinks that “countries on the

eastern coast of the Mediterranean ought to not use that term” (20) because it was misleading.

Later on, a conversation that started by a painting of Marc Chagall which was hanging on the wall of their house ended up with George asking the couple if they were aware that Marc Chagall was a Jew, M answers that he knew that Chagall was a Jew, and continued talking in an attempt to impress the boss by stating that it was a brief decision to go by a Jewish family name in Russia in those hard years, especially when most of the artists prefer not to show their origins. In that point, George Gabriel who doesn't appear amazed by this information prosaically asks M on which side he would fall on, “hide or express?” (20) M leaves this question unrequited by asking the humorous question “Do I look Jewish?”(20) and tries to flee from the situation.

From George’s behavior up till this point and his mindset later on the party we are able to experience that he seems to be on an assignment. His assignment is to discover M’s point of view on Islam, by closely investigating his house. However, George Gabriel gives the feeling that he already has a bad opinion of M, which is shocking given that the two have had no chance to get to know each other. George's pessimistic view can only be clarified by the fact that he is approaching the situation with prejudices against M.

Unsatisfied with M's response, George Gabriel resumes his inspection of the apartment and makes his way to the bookshelf, he carefully reviews each book and asks M where did he buy it from, Bothered by this unconventional behavior George appears, M considers that his boss might simply seen through his game and doubts that his scheme of trying to cater to him would succeed. When inspecting the bookshelf, George discovers M's full selection of Goethe and Nietzsche, which "takes up the third- and second-highest shelves."(23) M actually makes an impact on his employer with these two book collections, and it seems that

the earlier antipathy George had inspired appeared to melt away. He believes that by achieving this breakthrough, he would have found a way to "ingratiate" (23) himself to George. Both men hold Goethe and Nietzsche in high regard, with M even referring to them as "Gods of men"(22) George agrees with this high gradation of these two geniuses and believes it is fitting and "definitely worthy of the exalted position"(22) they have on the bookshelf since they can hover over us mortals. Hover over all of the other books within the global .This discovery at the bookshelf appears to have created a bond between the two men, a bond M have aimed to with the dinner party.

The events take an interesting turn when George Gabriel notices an object on the top of the bookshelf, which houses the whole selection of Goethe and Nietzsche books. The object is so tiny and far back on the shelf that M had no idea it had been placed there and had simply forgotten it all this time. After reaching the object, which was a small pouch containing something, M realizes his mother must have left it there when she last met him and Marie-Anne. And informs George, who is especially interested in what is inside the pouch, that it was a miniature Koran without much consideration.

George, who is very curious about what he and M found in his house, inspects the miniature edition of this Holy Scripture and returns it to its owner, as the Koran itself does not hold much appeal for George. M takes the Koran from George and places it back on the shelf where they find it, above the Goethe and Nietzsche texts. George is taken aback by this move and exclaims, "You're bringing something higher than Nietzsche?" (25) It is nonsensical to George that Nietzsche and Goethe, whom they praised only a few minutes earlier and who, for all of them, were the philosophers who rose above all else among mankind, have been overshadowed by the Koran.

This act has little more sense for M than it did before, because he sees this little Koran as a souvenir from his mother and a bit of decoration in his house. George, on the other hand, is taken aback by the fact that "the collected works of Muhammad are above the collected works of Nietzsche." A theist wins out over an atheist. "The Prophet of Arabia triumphs over the Devil of Bavaria." (25) He was wondering if this was a display of "some residual supremacism on behalf of the Koran." (25) We don't know what George means by this comment because their discussion doesn't go into any further detail.

It is the first time M has been faced with concerns about Islam, a faith he does not consider himself a part of, a religion he has never observed in his life, and a religion he has never thought about. He finds himself blessed that his parents never taught him Islam as a doctrine, helping him to keep a detachment from Islam throughout his life. His parents just taught him that he was not supposed to eat pork or have sexual intercourses before marriage. He has no verifiable understanding about Islam. M identifies himself in ways other than "only being a Muslim." (65)

His "focus had been on more secular matters" (65) as a child, such as how to mask his parents' accents by not allowing himself to be seen in public with them, or how to make his skin color disappear by standing next to Marie-Anne. M makes these attempts to fit in with society more easily because he is aware that the characteristics that distinguish him from the mainstream can lead to prejudice. But he doesn't just do these things to fit in; he also feels a connection to his home state of Alabama, where he was born and raised. He is proud of his heritage, which can be seen in the way he speaks with his southern accent to his dinner party guests. Even after thirteen years in Philadelphia, he still retains his southern practices and speaks in that way, as it is what he defines himself by. He has reflected and acted out the social identity that comes with being a southern American his whole life. However, the

incident with George Gabriel throws him off balance, since his identity was limited to being an American from the South and not a Pakistani-Muslim.

For those who do now not know him, M's appearances and full name are the first things they note about him. So they don't discover the true identity of M until they started inventing stereotypes like George Gabriel who also goes so far as to search M's apartment for evidence of these prejudices. M, like Changez in *The Reluctant Fundamentalist*, wears a white mask that is removed by his current employer. The discovery of the Koran in M's apartment results in his expulsion from Plutus Communications on his first day back after the dinner party. George Gabriel fires M in his office directly, without going into depth why he is released.

## **2.2 M's Sexual Experiences and its Effects on his Sense of Belonging to America**

The reader can understand from the first pages of the novel that the marriage of M and Marie-Anne is somewhat unorthodox, and that she is the one wearing the pants in the relationship, her reaction when she saw the desk, which her husband purchased without consulting her first, clearly reflects this. M is particularly pleased with the piece he discovered "in the heart of Philadelphia's historic Antique Row, which represents a Southern revivalist strain of design." (13) He connects the desk's architecture with his and Marie-Anne's southern roots, where he sees both of them rooted despite the fact that his parents emigrated from Pakistan to the United States. When her husband kisses her in public, Marie-Anne dislikes it because it implied possession, and Marie-Anne was loathe to give others the idea that she was possessed. M also argues in the novel that Marie-Anne was the man in the relationship, and that he was the ostensible "she".



Marie-Anne is a lady who is taller and heavier than her husband. This is one of the reasons her parents did not want her to marry him, and it had nothing to do with his faith or race, as her mother, Mrs. Quinn, states in an e-mail to her daughter, they were more worried about how "this pretty boy"(72) would defend their very stoutly constructed daughter. Mrs. Quinn continues to avoid the two, which Marie-Anne attributes to her mother's Catholic heritage, which has left her "unable to forgive betrayal." (17) This betrayal is that her daughter married a person who is of Muslim heritage and it is not because of M's bodily weak point towards their daughter, because this will be something Mrs. Quinn's religious schooling may want to forgive at some point.

Marie-Anne has a weight condition that began when the couple married, and even though she has shed much of her extra weight by exercise, the doctors told her that she still has some medical problems, and it is still impossible for her to have children because she will not survive the labor. M, on the other hand, values having children on his own because his parents are no longer alive and he has no other family in the United States. It's also likely that M needs to leave a name behind himself that his parents don't have, given that he "was a second-generation American with deceased parents"(11). His parents came to the United States with high aspirations, believing that it was "the only place on the planet where success trumps blood" (64), this contradicts M's view of the American society, as shown by his comparison of his wife's family pictures to his own. "My family's photographs were nearly always indoors, because my parents were citizens who paid rent for the majority of their lives," (64) he says. The bulk of Marie-Anne's family portraits are taken outside. They were landowners, people of substance, and stewards of a legacy.

Candace Cooper, M's coworker, is the only female character in the novel who plays a significant part in his life, and she even attends the dinner party. We can tell M is drawn to Candace by the way he mentions her early in the novel. When the party is over and M is in

bed with Marie-Anne, they begin to chat about Candace and making comments about her height , and Marie-Anne says, "Skinnier than any black girl I've seen." (28) She starts by contrasting Candace's physique to that of a ballerina and an ice skater, which are body shapes she never had, even in her youth before gaining all the weight. As a prelude to their copulation, M fabricates a story in which Candace and Marie-Anne have intimate encounters, causing his wife to become aroused. The story's most striking feature is that Marie-Anne is superior to Candace, which seems to be a sexual desire she has all the time. The role plays M produces to arouse his wife describe the couple's sexual life, these stories feature ballerinas, dolls, college girls, assistants, and masseuses, and "Marie-Anne consumes them all" (31) in what M refers to as their sexual interpretation. This sexual behavior demonstrates that Marie-Anne is the superior partner to M, as she is the relationship's primary sexual partner. Their bedroom reflects the balance of their relationship, of which Marie-Anne is the more dominant aspect. M follows Marie- Anne's orders in bed, just as he followed her instructions to go buy tampons for her at the dinner party he organized. She doesn't mention anything to her husband, but M realizes it without questioning that it's his responsibility to purchase them because he failed to buy a backup in advance. It's also worth noting that only Marie- Anne's sexual needs need stories to be fulfilled during their interpretation of lovemaking.

The pair was expected to have coitus in a manner that would not impregnate Marie-Anne because she refuses to take birth control due to the weight gain it induces and M is reluctant to use contraceptives. As a result, Marie-Anne is the first to be happy in the bedroom, followed by M. He, on the other hand, does not need any kind of imagination to be fulfilled. M is on his own, aside from his wife, who is just a bystander. But M seems to be fine with the nature of their sexual lifestyle as for him his wife's health is the most essential thing in the world. M not being able to reach his wife during intercourse is

the paradigm of him not being recognized by American society as an American citizen, and like society has refused him, Marie-Anne's body has rejected him as well.

M and Marie-Anne had their first sexual intercourse while on their honeymoon at Disney World. M was wearing Mickey Mouse ears, and Marie-Anne was wearing a tiara. M in the middle of the act called his newlywed wife "my princess," (161) which Marie-Anne considered insulting. She moved her husband aside and put the tiara on his head. And on their first date, when they were both virgins with no clear sexual impulses, Marie-Anne's dominating personality transitioned from the first minute into the marriage bed. The act of placing the tiara on M's head represents the establishment of the bedroom and marriage hierarchy.

The relationship between M and Marie-Anne shifts throughout the novel, as he no longer wants to follow his wife. M is untouched by Marie-Anne's struggles at work. She attempts to draw his attention subtly by having her husband compose her new poetry for her exercise sessions, but she does not succeed because her husband refuses to accept her indirect requests. After M refuses to continue writing her poetry, Marie-Anne gained a lot of weight and she felt that punishing herself is the only way for her to punish her husband. But M was well aware that she really wanted his duty, not his ardor. This silence between the two contributed to the breakdown of their marriage.

M had extramarital affairs with women other than his wife in the novel. Farkhunda, a member of the Gay Commie Muzzies, is one of these women. One day, they visited the mausoleum of Bawa Muhaiyaddeen after meeting the GCMs, where the sixteen-year-old girl sexually pleases M. He had never had this kind of experience with Marie-Anne since he was still subordinate to his wife during their intimacies. For the first time during an intercourse, M refuses to do what is expected of him, refusing to follow Farkhunda when she asks him to

satisfy her. Farkhunda was at the bottom of the hierarchical hierarchy, which was headed by Marie-Anne. she is a Muslim immigrant's kid, not a white American. M claims that he went off with Farkhunda because of his "weakness of the desire to be superior." (129) However, he is unable to pinpoint the source of this need. Was this desire for supremacy something he established as a result of his connection to the faith of Islam, or was it something that was inherent in his status in America? (159)

M is having lunch with Ali in a deli in North Philadelphia one day when he sees Candace for the first time since being let go by Plutus. Candace is dressed in a headscarf and seems to have been a model for an Islamic couture magazine. She claims she left Plutus after the organization began shuffling their employees in an irrational manner, and began working as a video producer for Al Jazeera's AJ+. Candace is not a Muslim by birth but converts to Islam later in life, and M believes that her separation from Plutus led her to become frustrated, prompting her to convert.

M and Marie-Anne resume their festivities at a hookah bar on the evening of their 10th wedding anniversary, after attending the Friday-night jazz at the art museum. They are able to bypass the very long queue for the venue and get a table before anybody else who is waiting. M suspects that his white wife is the reason they were able to get so quickly into the hookah joint, which is mainly frequented by second generation Arab immigrants. He and Ali had a dialogue earlier in the novel about gaining privilege by his marriage to a white woman, and M is suddenly shocked by the possibility that this is real. He curses Ali Ansari for implanting those thoughts in his mind, for instilling color into his "once-innocent myopia." (163) He was content not to see the truth he was trapped in because he had chosen myopia. The couple has another discussion about having children at the hookah joint, and it turns out that their marriage has been severely harmed and cannot be fixed.

Following their split, Marie-Anne goes home, and M calls Candace Cooper and welcomes her to the hookah place. They have a detailed talk about Candace's family and childhood, as well as the different reasons for her conversion to Islam. She thought she needed to belong to something founded on inclusiveness, something that removed the gaps between people until she converted. The night persists in various places until they arrive in North Philly. During their chat, the two form a closer relationship, and M discovers that he has even more in common with Candace than with his wife.

Candace and M end up spending the night together at her apartment that night. He regains the dominance and masculinity he lacked all along. This inferiority has been mirrored in his character outside of the bedroom, where he was never a man who exuded confidence, especially in his professional climate. Candace makes a joke about her future children the next day, which throws M into a tailspin because it is a delicate subject for him. But despite the fact that he thought he had a special experience with Candace, M abandons her and avoids her texts because he believes he “was just the product of a transient disorientation she experienced on a bizarre and unreal night.”(194) and He was sorry for being unfaithful to his wife of nine years and was determined to save his marriage.

However, when they had unprotected intercourse, M is concerned that he may have impregnated Candace and tries to reach her, even though what he did was adultery, he had a glimmer of hope that Candace will bear a child for him, as this will “promote the phase of generation-buildings as much as possible.”(239) when failing to locate her, he contacted Ali Ansari, with whom he expresses his thoughts. These fears are reinforced when M discovers that Candace was already pregnant. The first time they saw each other again after spending the night together was several months later, and Candace expressed her disappointment that M did not reach out to her and sent someone. And that person was his friend Ali Ansari, who found Candace and married her so that her child would not grow up without a father.

### 2.3 The development of M's relationship with Islam

One of the few friends M has is called Richard Konigsberg, a former Plutus colleague who took him into this business from the first place after his dismissal. Richard is one of the few people he truly trusts, despite the fact that he is a Jew, since M was never a guy who was concerned about people's religious identities. In one night M calls him to tell him of the news. The news M tells to Richard enrages him, and he begins to mutter.

During their chat, Richard mentions to M that he knows George Gabriel and his wife, whom are Germans. They both believed that "after they confronted the issue of Hitler and took blame for it, they can now judge the rest of the world," he says. They see fascism all over them, but never in themselves.”(51) As a result, George was taken aback when he saw M placing the Koran back on the shelf where he placed it, above the Nietzsche and Goethe texts. George has labeled this as an act motivated by M's residual supremacism, which Candace confirms when she eventually joins M and Richard. After George parted with M at the dinner party, he told Candace, in his drunken state, about the act of putting the Koran on the higher shelf, which still bothers him. The three of them assumed that it was the reason that led to M's firing, and Richard proposes suing Plutus for religious discrimination, which M refuses because, after all, he does not consider himself to be a Muslim. Even his wife, Marie-Anne, claims that M's Muslim name and the appearance of the Koran in their apartment are to blame for his dismissal from the company.

M considers the Koran, which he still has in his flat, to be a holy item, but he does not value it as such. For him, it is more for decoration than anything else. Furthermore, he values it for the homemade pouch created by his deceased mother, rather than the Koran itself. However, he suspects that this behavior has fuelled his boss's bigotry against Muslims and prompted him to believe that M harbors some residual supremacism within him. When

he makes this remark, his wife Marie-Anne just laughs, claiming that her husband had no supremacist bone in his body, this declaration by his wife is important and indirectly affects M's actions in the book, her referring to him as "obedient in every part of his life"(61). and M recognizing that he lacked the authority to command and maintain order acts as the starting point of his transformation in the novel.

To assist her husband in regaining his career, Marie-Anne asks M to contact George Gabriel to inform him that he misunderstood him by elevating the Koran above Nietzsche and Goethe, and that he really cared for the pouch made by his dead mother, and that the Koran had no value for him, so he got rid of it. M is appalled at his wife's idea and attempts to reverse fact so she can consider his point of view by asking, "How would you react if you were to tell your employer that you put the Bible in the trash?"(61) Following this suggestion, Marie-Anne claims that there is a noticeable contrast between the two faiths in terms of the feelings they elicit in individuals. When Marie-Anne is about to leave for a week-long business trip, this comment sparks a quarrel between the pair, resulting in an arduous taciturnity that lasted for a long time.

The silence between the pair as Marie-Anne leaves for the trip lasts a long time, and M even stop to write his wife the poems he wrote for her exercise sessions so she could concentrate more comfortably. Surprisingly, it is not about M becoming unemployed, but about him being defensive of a religion of which he never considered himself a part of. After this Sharp debate with his wife, his frustration with his marriage begins to surface, and he sinks into a deep depression. M believes he has failed as an American and has given up hope of ever becoming a truly welcomed American because he is the product of immigrants. Owing to his childhood in Alabama, he saw himself as both an American and a Southerner up until his dismissal. He built an identity for himself that matched the needs of the time and place he was in and thought that this will help him belong and by this he will not have any

difficulties in his life. He felt he fit in well with America's diverse cultural heritages, but the incident with George Gabriel proved him wrong.

Regardless of the rise of anti-Muslim rhetoric in the United States, Muslims have always had a negative reputation in the country. A analysis of over 900 American films revealed that Hollywood has often conflated Arab and Muslim cultures when portraying both groups negatively (Shaheen 2001). Such attitudes have only been exacerbated by post-9/11 policies in the United States and global developments that link American Muslims to political violence in the Middle East. The consequences of 9/11 and its impact have resulted in a lack of identity for Muslims in the United States. The lack of identity is especially intriguing because it is the loss of their American identity rather than their Muslim identity (Abu-Ras and al. 2013). Mir (2011) observed that the borders of 'Americanness' have shrunk in the aftermath of the 9/11 attacks. Fine and Sirin (2007) reported that Muslims were “evicted from the moral community of psychological citizenship in the United States” after 9/11. (p. 18). This has caused young Muslim Americans to doubt or, in some situations, declare their identities (Peek 2005).

This "eviction" has expressed itself in legal, cultural, social, and psychological attacks directed at the Muslim community in America. These threats have resulted in a growing sense of alienation as the government and a number of media outlets target the Muslim community, prompting many members of this community to work to reclaim their psychological citizenship from mainstream society. Muslims born in the United States, in particular, have been compelled to discuss their origins. This resulted in frustration and embarrassment. In the meantime, the "othering" of Muslims in the United States has fostered cohesion within the Muslim community in the United States, as well as a desire to establish one's identity as a Muslim (Alsultany 2007; Muedini 2009; Zaman 2008).



The intense media focus on Muslims in the United States has compelled Muslims to reflect seriously on what it means to be both Muslim and American. According to one report, terror attacks carried out by Muslims earned over 300 percent greater attention than equivalent attacks carried out by non-Muslims (Kearns and al. 2019). As a result, and in accordance with reactive identity theory, increased negative media coverage has reinforced Muslims' identification with Islam and ability to identify with their religion. Haddad (2007) states that this is a re-Islamization phenomenon that existed prior to the 9/11 attacks but was intensified by them.

This fabricated identity seems to have served him well before the September 11th attacks. "It all was lost as New York got neutered after the attacks." (69) Every American was killed in a different way that September. And M was among them. 9/11 altered both the country and the person. M said that when the towers fell he simply attested to himself that he wasn't a Muslim, and moved on from any feeling of complicity or guilt or involvement. M's behavior is driven mainly by self-preservation. To stop American animosity, he chooses to keep his distance from Islam. The glimmer of an affiliation with Islam that barely existed before 9/11 vanished entirely.

Mimirco, the organization in which Marie-Anne works sends her to Doha for a business meeting, where she encounters a man named Mahmoud, with whom she tells the story of her husband's firing. Mahmoud informs Marie-Anne that she made a mistake by asking her husband to withdraw the Koran from their house. It's remarkable that it took another guy to make her know that she was expecting something insensitive from her husband, as Marie-Anne puts it. It seems that Marie-Anne respects Mahmoud's views more than she respects her husband's. She hopes that networking with Mahmoud would lead to new market prospects for her husband, as his unemployment time has lasted way too long.

Marie-Anne had even planned a career for her unemployed husband as a freelance promoter and had already set up a meeting with a prospective client named Qasim, whom she met through Mahmoud's business contacts. Qasim plans to release a health and fitness DVD based on a process he calls 'Salato.' Salato is derived from the Arabic word for prayer, on which the whole fitness concept is based. Salato exercises imitate the motions of the Islamic prayer ritual in a quicker and more demanding way, giving it the impression of a workout routine. Qasim has already filmed the video for his fitness routine and is simply asking M to advertise it and give him attention. M watches the Salato video in which Qasim describes where the gestures from Islamic prayer come from. He attempts to connect all the religions by claiming that the prophet Mohammed was influenced by "the full-body way of prayer that was already known to seventh-century Arabs." (93)

Eventually, M creates a presentation for the Salato initiative, for which Qasim wishes to be present in person, and also invites Mahmoud, as he was the business relation who took M and Qasim together. The meeting with Qasim and Mahmood takes place at M's flat, where his wife is also present. It is the first time that people have visited their apartment after M's dinner party. M glances around the bookshelf as he cleans the apartment for the visitors and finds some books that could get him in trouble. As he looks at the bookshelf this time, he isn't worried with the Koran, which he put some time earlier into the antique desk, but rather with his Nietzsche series and Rushdie's works. As a precaution, M moves the books to a place where the two men cannot see them.

Mahmoud's arrival suddenly floods the room with his aura, as, unlike M, Mahmoud is a person with executive powers whose presence is surely felt. He is a man who loves to show off his religious roots by his clothes, donning a traditional Muslim skullcap, a scarf swirled around his neck with a Middle Eastern flair, and a "turquoise rosary that keeps slipping out from beneath his sleeve." (96)

M's presentation for 'Salato' is not as good as anticipated. He chooses to shift the emphasis away from Islamic prayer and toward self-worship. His rationale is that avoiding language associated with Islam would maximize the popularity of their commodity. The slogan M suggests for the movement, "worship yourself,"(99) does not correspond in any way to the idea Qasim was looking for, since in Islam, allegiance to anything other than Allah is forbidden and is pointed to as 'shirk'. Qasim is offended by the slogan and shares his frustration with M, particularly because he chose to work with him because of his Muslim heritage.

After Qasim storms out of the house, it is clear that the contract will not go through, resulting in a confrontation between Marie-Anne and M. M is upset that his wife told Mahmoud and Qasim that he was Muslim in order to get the job and seal the business contract of her own company MimirCo, which also collaborated with Mahmoud. Marie-Anne refused to even consider her husband's accusation and defends her plan by saying "Sue me for believing that possessing a Muslim name would be a goddamn asset to me, but clearly that was a mistake. You suck at being an asset. You can't even be yourself"(101), even Marie-Anne has begun to doubt her husband's identity as well. Before her confrontation, during which she attempted to demonstrate to him that Islam has a far more negative reputation than the other faiths, she believed her husband had distanced himself from his Muslim roots and was an unreligious American citizen. Her husband is experiencing an identity crisis as a result of his dismissal from Plutus. Being fired from his work because he was a Muslim, though he was not, introduced M to the disturbing fact of Islamophobia and bigotry in the United States.

Previous study has looked into the link between discrimination, identity, and personality in young adult Muslims in the United States (Casey 2017; Tabbah et al. 2016). The article indicated that Muslims in the United States face prejudice and discrimination

from both non-Muslims and Muslims. As a result, Muslims face Islamophobia from non-Muslims, while some 'non-orthodox' Muslims face discrimination from more traditional Muslims, and some Muslims face discrimination from both classes (Casey 2017).

Researchers hypothesized, based on a study of 60 Arab American adolescents, that perceptions of discrimination may cause adolescents to explore their ethnic identity. They report a strong sense of belonging after developing a sense of community ethnic identity (Tabbah and al. 2016). Extending this study to a more culturally diverse sample and incorporating experiences of religious and racial persecution will help to advance the study on Muslim identity formation in the United States.

Furthermore, research shows that in response to discrimination, young adult Muslims engage in a variety of activities that either conceal or exaggerate their Muslim identity (Casey 2017). Besides that, Muslims have been forced to describe themselves in terms of 'good Muslim' and 'bad Muslim,' and have worked to gain the status of 'good minority' (Mohammed 2015). Moreover; according to research, Muslims in Norway and Germany who have experienced stereotypes and discrimination have a negative effect on their national identity (Kunst and al. 2012)

M is questioning his place in the world and whether he has ever found a place that was valuable to the people around him. Many of these issues emerge as a result of his firing for an identity he did not engage. M wants a place to go to get away from all of these feelings, but he also realizes that his options are small because he is unemployed and has no money. The city center is still out of the picture because he is fearful of running into old Plutus.

While strolling through North Philly, the urban area of Philadelphia where minorities live, M comes across a "Moorish looking guy" (104), who begins to follow him around. After a brief chase, M and the Moor meet, and the mysterious man asks the protagonist if he

wants his true citizenship and to join the righteous country. M declines this generous bid, telling the men that he has no desire to pursue a new country because he is still struggling with the one he is a member of.

This brief conversation with the Moor has made an indelible mark on M, and he is unable to escape it. The Moor, like so many other people in North Philly, “had established ways of coping with the isolation that the people in the skyscrapers imposed,” (106) and M envied this skill. But the most striking difference between the Moor and M was the second passport to fall back on if his first passport, the USA, was denied. M discovers during this experience that he does not have such a backup, which further drowns him in his despondency.

After this experience with the Moor, M's aimless wanderings through the suburbs of North Philadelphia come to an end, and he goes back to Temple University the next day. There, he proceeds to spread the business cards that Marie-Anne had printed for him, Ali Ansari, the student, becomes aware of him as a result of this. When Ali presents himself to M, he thinks that M is Muslim and provides a reference to his surname 'Ansari,' which M does not understand. The name on the business card, which the reader also does not know, must be a stereotypical Muslim name so it leads to the assumption that M is a Muslim many times, which is most likely why he goes by the abbreviation M and not his full name.

Ali Ansari is a documentary filmmaker who is dressed in a “black trench coat cinched at the waist and a white turtleneck, paired with tan wool slacks slipping loosely into silver-buckled loafers.”(107); unlike Mahmoud, Ali's style is much more western and modernized and is not affected by his religious background, since he chooses to dress in more western clothing. M meets the president of the Muslim Students Association, Hatim, and their secretary, Saba, via Ali. Ali is their adviser, and he advised them to collaborate with a

publicity consultant so that their campaign could hit a broader audience. The organization works to dispel common misconceptions about Islam and Muslims. They want to act as a bridge between Muslims and the American society, which is in need of clarity.

M recognizes Ali as a kindred spirit early on. They take a stroll through Philadelphia, and M learns that Ali graduated from Temple University many years ago, and that his real age is close to thirty. He thinks he has met a friend with a similar perspective on life, as becoming a Muslim in America was a constant pain in the heart for both of them. M believes that aside from his wife and Richard Konigsberg, Ali will realize what it meant to be labeled a residual supremacist. M had definitely never had a friend like Ali before because he had never communicated with Muslims before. As a result, none of his relatives, family, or wife ever realized what kind of situation he was living in. His deceased parents were the only Muslims he met, having immigrated to America in search of a better life and a safer future for their son. They did not see America like their son and Ali did. It's likely that when they immigrated, Islamophobia was not a problem. However, it is also likely that they were not confronted with those questions because they did not seem to them as such, as they embraced life as it was.

## **2.4 The Muslim Communities in the Novel**

The Gay Commie Muzzies and the Muslim intellectuals who represent the United States on foreign forums are the two groups of second-generation Muslims who feature in the novel and with whom M has encounters. The two communities have differing views on their Muslim roots and how their society treats them because of it. The most important distinction between them is that GCM members are much more pessimistic than intellectual group members.

Farkhunda is a participant of the GCM's youth. Her father, Mushtaq Hakim, a millionaire surgeon, was the founder of many charities that helped families in Bosnia, Chechnya, Kashmir, Iraq, Palestine, and other countries where Muslims have been persecuted since the 1990s. He was one of the Muslim-Americans who were being tracked by the police since 9/11, and when it was revealed that one of the families his foundation had helped had raised a suicide bomber, he was arrested. Mushtaq Hakim was humiliated by the American establishment and forced to flee the country for reasons beyond his control. After her father's expulsion, Farkhunda develops a profound hate for America, as her faith and nationality have become targets for Islamophobic acts, making her fatherless. As M tells her that both of their fathers have gone, Farkhunda responds that it was not the same thing, because Allah took his dad while America stole her father.

The GCM gather in a house in a Philadelphia town to spend time together. Ali Ansari refers to them as "our basic suburbanite Muslim society." (143) Asymptotes are points of no return. "As similar to white as possible without crossing the line." (143) Members of the GCM are hiding in order to avoid being "distrustful," (144) and being known as the enemy. Whose approach to proving their innocence is diametrically opposed to that of fundamentalists. Unlike the fundamentalists, who believe they only need to prove how pious and peaceful they are, the GCM believes they only need to demonstrate how nude and pleasant they are.

What the GCM does is essentially attempt to live the life that every single young person in America lives. But in order to do so, they are compelled to rebel because they have been pigeonholed by American society. Following 9/11, the word "Muslim" became "synonymous with the devil," (144) which greatly hampered the lives of Muslim youth. Young Hybrid-Muslim Americans who were still dealing with puberty and adolescence

faced that added challenge of being oppressed internally or by their family, as in Farkhunda's case.

Farkhunda's sister Saba, who is also a member of Temple University's Muslim Student Association, became very religious after her father's expulsion and persuaded her younger sister to wear the hijab and live modestly. Saba is a member of the other community of Muslims Ali listed earlier. She chose the fundamentalist side, which seeks to portray Muslims' innocence by the campaigns the Muslim Student Association of Temple University started.

Identifying in collective group ideologies is a part of identity formation for young adults. Collective identities refer to facets of one's identity that are based on party affiliation, such as ethnicity or religion (Ashmore and al. 2004). For example, young adults go through the process of self-categorization, which is the deliberate selection of the affiliation group(s) in which they wish to affiliate. According to research, communal religious identity is very significant among Muslims (Fish 2011); However, study has largely failed to concentrate on young adult Muslims. This research only looks at young adult Muslims because they are in the stage of identity formation where they are consciously selecting and exploring which groups (e.g., ethnicity, gender, nationality, etc.) they want to identify with and how important these groups are to them.

Mahmoud, whom M encountered through his wife, faced similar difficulties in his youth. Being Muslim has derailed his baseball career, which he hoped to pursue as a young man. After seeing how willing Americans were to blame Muslims for all what went wrong, he realized he wanted to go into public service, and he felt he needed to take a stand in the growth of American history. In comparison to Farkhunda and the other GCM founders, he considers himself to be an American. Mahmoud believes in a more multicultural America



because the positive aspects of his life overshadow the negative aspects. Mahmoud was a serious, wise man who trusted in those principles of civilization, culture, and development and aimed to put them into action through institutions and governance.

Via Mahmoud, M meets a group of young aspiring Muslim-Americans who believed that life was spent better minimizing global conflict, changing their forefathers' religion, and fighting towards international peace, all in the name of America. They think they will live a fulfilling life in America and do not wallow in self-pity like the GCM. They also play an active role in influencing the world, as the shape of the world affects the form of people's minds.

M begins collaborating with these young hopeful Muslim-Americans, who collaborate with the State Department, which sponsors their trips where they participate as ambassadors for good Muslim integration and assimilation into the United States, as Leila, one of their participants, describes. M identifies with this group of Muslims even better than with the GCM because they had a community that subscribed to the generally accepted concepts of success. He understands that working with them would get him the satisfaction he wants in both his professional and personal life. M Joining this community of intellectual Muslim-Americans and beginning to collaborate with them flips the American social hierarchy on its head. Along with them, he is sent overseas to promote the reputation of the United States in terms of minority treatment, with the government covering all of his expenses. He tells his wife, gleefully, about his new job: "It means the US government needs to send your husband as a Messenger of America." (211) This current situation is somewhat ironic, given that Islamophobia in the United States has left him jobless and desperate at the beginning of the story.

M has no regrets over joining the committee of intellectuals and also admits that he picked the right side as he moves through North Philadelphia, where he was never supposed to trapeze through the city like a native son. He was looking for his true identity after being fired from Plutus and hoped to find it through his new friend Ali Ansari and the GCM in a neglected and ignored part of the world. In retrospect, however, he sees no link between himself and this part of the city. People who live there are mundane and embrace their place in society, but M insists he belongs somewhere else.

M, like Changez, aspires to rise through the ranks of American society. M is pleased with the new life and identity he has created for himself. He and Leila, another member of the Muslim Intellectuals party, are sent to Madrid as cultural ambassadors to give a talk in front of young Muslims in Spain about their lives as Muslims in the United States. M and Leila only emphasize the good aspects of their lives in their speeches, and M excludes the period of his life where he was fired from his job and was accused of harboring residual supremacism. He also fails to note Brother Hatim's apprehension that his fundamentalism will be an issue in the United States, as well as Ali Ansari's pessimistic feelings about America and its handling of Muslims. He ignores the existence of a persecuted religious community.

### **Chapter Three**

#### **The struggle for identity and the question of belonging in *The Reluctant Fundamentalist***

## **Introduction**

*The Reluctant Fundamentalist* depicts a modern sociopolitical and cultural quandary in which Americans and Pakistanis are ambivalent allies as well as rivals on the global stage. Hamid conceives the transformation of an individual subject to the continuously changing world in *The Reluctant Fundamentalist*. His postcolonial consciousness explores diaspora and nationality as defined entities. The protagonist's search for identity and belonging is framed as a transition from Pakistan to America, from a pre-9/11 world to a post-9/11 world with tighter migration controls. It articulates fluid, unsettled, and homogeneous identities. In *The Reluctant Fundamentalist*, a global citizen's identity lies at the crossroads of the national identities with diasporic consciousness and also includes the racial, ethnic and religious divisions (Quratulain Shirazi 19).

This chapter examines the problem of hybridity and identity struggle as it is encountered by the novel's main character. It depicts Changez's struggle to stay in-between, it shows how he struggles to belong to both his homeland and America; I will discuss how he struggles to find his identity inside the western society and how the world has changed since 9/11, which has significantly added to his struggle. I will also explore the transition from caring about oneself to caring about one's country and faith, the chapter will analyze all aspects of Changez's identity, it will also demonstrate how Changez's personal, social, and political experiences lead him to make a difficult yet predictable decision at the end of the story.

### **3.1 Changez' Americanness in *The Reluctant Fundamentalist***

Told by Changez the Pakistani protagonist, *The Reluctant Fundamentalist* is a novel which recounts his time in America. Changez now much older meets a foreign man in Lahore, Pakistan, and he instantly identifies as an American. The two men chat over tea, and

Chapter three: the struggle for identity and the question of belonging in *the Reluctant fundamentalist*

the reader can only hear Changez speaking. We never hear the American speak and therefore must depend on the reflection Changez creates to discern what he is saying and asking. We hear about Changez's experience as a Princeton University student and as a young adult working and living in New York City during the talk.

According to Changez, foreign students had to take more exams than their American counterparts in order to enroll at Princeton. While overseas students were welcomed at American universities, Changez says he understands that the relationship is based on a compromise on both sides, and that they were required to contribute their talents to their community, the community they were entering. Changez realizes that in order to become a member of the US Society, he must be successful. Luckily, Changez has not faced any difficulties as a result of this situation. Since he is a good student at Princeton, he is guaranteed a work interview with Underwood Samson Company, who visits his university as a corporate recruiter while he is in his final year of studies.

Changez begins to feel American only after joining Underwood Samson and moving from New Jersey to New York City. Despite the fact that he only stayed in New York for eight months before returning to Pakistan, he considers these eight months to be the most satisfying of his life in the United States. Changez's sense of Americanness is enhanced also by his employment at Underwood Samson. He brings frictionless into the organization, adopting their ideology and beginning to speak collectively by using we to refer to his colleagues. He acknowledges the new role identity bestowed upon him by his academic degree and occupation (Carter 1).

When Changez came first after the observer trainee program that all of the new Underwood Samson trainees pursued, He felt like a young New Yorker with the city at his feet, and immersed in a warm sense of accomplishment as he said. Changez's sense of

Chapter three: the struggle for identity and the question of belonging in *the Reluctant fundamentalist*

belonging to America and representing it to the rest of the world grows even stronger as he goes on a business trip to Manila, Philippines, where he behaves and sounds more like an American after noticing that the Filipinos with whom they collaborated in Manila are more respectful to his American colleague, this encourages him to want a piece of that respect too. He instantly feels at ease in this aspect of American identity, which he identifies with traditional American gestures and expression, he transforms himself into the social identity that he aspires to be a part of by adapting these features. Changez aims to be more like his colleagues, who already have those American qualities, and to have a social identity that reflects his highest aspirations (Carter 1).

Changez identifies his Americanness via his academic position and subsequent prestigious career. His colleagues, are a diverse group consisted of two women and two non-white people, Amongst them is Wainwright, who, aside from his boss Jim, he has the closest working relationship with at the workplace. Despite the variety of the group, they have one thing in common, which is being graduated from the best universities of America; they were all graduates of the same prestigious universities. This accomplishment, according to Changez, is what it takes to become an actual American, a productive fulfillment of the American dream. His university degree identifies not only the American dream, but also his membership in the social community of Underwood Samson. The likeness between Changez and Jim, the general manager who too enrolled him and the other learners at Underwood Samson, fortify his conviction in his capacity to realize full participation in this social community. in the interview of the job at the Underwood Samson, Jim immediately sees Changez as an enthusiastic young man who reminds him of his own background, this is what Jim finds most interesting about the young student During the job interview, so much that he tells Changez his own story.

Chapter three: the struggle for identity and the question of belonging in *the Reluctant fundamentalist*

Jim, even though he is a Native American, he has suffered in a similar manner to Changez, and that is why he empathizes with the young man. This reinforces Changez's belief that he is deserving of his current status and that his Pakistani background no longer matters, especially that his "Pakistaniness was hidden behind his suit, his expense account, and most importantly, his colleagues." (72)

Changez covers under his American mask during a business trip to Manila in order to talk to the Filipinos in a way that he would not as a Pakistani person. He begins to address employees his father's age with orders such as "I want it immediately." (66) which he is embarrassed of because, in comparison to his peers, he is known for being naturally respectful and professional. He mimics his American counterparts' demanding demeanor when dealing with subordinate coworkers, so we can see that he compromises his integrity in order to fit in with the group.

The ambivalent image of culture produced in the form of colonialism serves as the foundation for Bhabha's critique of traditional cultural comprehension. A transmittance occurs in the interaction between the colonizer and the colonized, where the colonizer transmits his identity to the colonized community. The colonized are simply imitating the ideology of the colonizer (Bhabha, *The Location of Culture* 122). Bhabha said that The Colonial mimicry is the desire for a reformed, recognizably different Other, as a matter of a distinction that is nearly but not quite the same. This condition has also been identified by Frantz Fanon, as Bhabha explains that the light skinned man's deception etched on the dark skinned man's body (*The Location of Culture*, 64). While it might seem that power ties between the two instances have faded after the so-called abolition of imperial institutions, the colonizer's power over the colonized is still enshrined in so many dimensions of the colonized cultures' lives. Bhabha expands on Frantz Fanon's and Jean-Paul Sartre's initial approaches and reveals how literature identifies the imperial contradictions at the heart of

### Chapter three: the struggle for identity and the question of belonging in *the Reluctant fundamentalist*

Western modernity, bringing to light the haunting unhomeliness of our pasts for those who are marginalized because of their color of skin, sexuality, faith, age, class, and so forth.

An indeterminacy is easily evident during the mimicry process, in which the colonizer is imitated by the colonized (Bhabha, *The Location of Culture* 122). Bhabha said that the mimicry emerges as a representation of a difference, which is a process of denial in and of itself. The colonized is simply following the colonizer's instructions, which are not visible nor audible. Nonetheless, their relationship is governed by a set of rules where it appropriates the Other by displaying power (Bhabha, *The Location of Culture* 122). The development of the so-called condition of hybridity is rooted in mimicry. Hybridity has been described in postcolonial discourse as a synthesis of two or more cultural identities that arose as a result of colonialism (Bhabha, *The Location of Culture* 122). The term hybridity Typically refers to the emergence of new transcultural forms inside the contact zone created by colonial rule (Ashcroft 135). The cradle of the third space is the interaction of those cultures. Bhabha purposefully refers to this product as a space, since hybridity to him is the third space which enables other positions to emerge (Bhabha, *The Third Space* 211). and not merely the interaction of two or more pre-existing cultures that results in the creation of a new one. This third space is marked by its lack of representation, which constitutes the discursive enunciation conditions that make sure that the meaning and signs of culture have no primordial unity or fixity; that even the same symbols can be appropriated, translated, rehistoricized, and read all over again (Bhabha, *The Location of Culture* 55).

It is important to emphasize that the third space allows for the introduction of new identities rather than just establishing a convergence of two or more preexisting societies. Each individual creates this third space on their own, so it grows in a new way each time. by constructing a stairwell as liminal space, and being the connective tissue that constructs the distinction between upper and low, black and white (Bhabha, *The Location of Culture* 5).



Chapter three: the struggle for identity and the question of belonging in *the Reluctant fundamentalist*

This newly acquired space plays the function of establishing the order that was clearly visible in the colonial sense. This third space is the first moment in which the principle of difference between individuals is highlighted. As mentioned previously, social and racial disparities are becoming apparent in this newly developing third space, and These differences express themselves through social behaviors (Bhabha, *The Location of Culture* 5).

The hybrid identities that arise as a result of these transformations are perceived negatively because they are continually fighting prejudices regarding their belonging. Racism and xenophobia are the consequences of these prejudices, which hybrids are continually confronted with (Bhabha, *The Location of Culture* 330). This is where communities come into play as a place of refuge for people with hybrid identities. Bhabha clarified that In the metropolitan space, the community is the territory of the minority, threatening civility claims; in the global world, it becomes the border-problem of the diasporic, the immigrant, the refugee (Bhabha, *The Location of Culture* 330). Communities are important structural institutions in society and have played this role since the start of history, because they determine the structure of our societies. And the division of people into these various communities characterized by religious, racial, or financial identity has often affected people's views towards each other (Bhabha, *The Location of Culture* 330).

### **3.2Unveiling the Protagonist's American Mask**

Changez learns early on in his journey to Manila that his fake Americanness is not well accepted by the natives. Once the Underwood Samson group's car gets stuck in traffic, Changez engages in a glower with a nearby Filipino man who is riding in the line of traffic beside their limousine. The man casts an aggressive glance over his shoulder, as if he disapproves of the American foreigners doing business in his city.

### Chapter three: the struggle for identity and the question of belonging in *the Reluctant fundamentalist*

Changez believes that the mysterious man looking at them has a negative impression of an American businessman in black suits traveling in a black limousine and thus expresses his disdain with this reaction, but maybe what Changez doesn't realize would be that the intruder, with whom he shares a glance, may have seen beyond his American mask. Admittedly, the mask is noticeable, as in Frantz Fanon's book *Black Skin, White Masks*. Changez is one of the people who are hiding their identity by wearing a white mask. This interaction with the Filipino on the street, as well as the brief discussion he has with his American colleagues who have blond hair and blue eyes, leads him to believe that he has been behaving all along and that he feels far closer to the Filipino driver than to his colleagues at the time. He too thinks that he should be outside, like all the Filipinos, rather than inside the limousine with all these white Americans. The American mask he was wearing during his time in Manila was removed simply by exchanging glances with a passing stranger, who made Changez realize he had been misled all along.

Wainwright, another trainee at Underwood Samson, rapidly becomes one of Changez's best friends at the company. He, like Changez, was competing for the top place rankings that Underwood Samson was doing on a regular basis. Wainwright and Changez have a late dinner at the Pak-Punjab Deli after their first night out, when they celebrate their admission to their company with all the trainees, as he discovers he made a great friend at the company, Changez hopes to thrive as a member of American society because of Wainwright's influence. Who is the other member of the group who contributes to the group's diversity, whose father is from Caribbean region, as can be seen by his skin tone.

Changez and Wainwright are chosen to ride in the car with Jim to the company's summer celebration at Jim's property in the Hamptons, which, Changez believes is because they are the most successful apprentices at the company. Everyone starts talking during the trip, apart from Changez and Jim, who are watching everyone. Jim, who observed Changez's

Chapter three: the struggle for identity and the question of belonging in *the Reluctant fundamentalist*

actions during the car journey, says, "You're a watchful man. You know where that comes from? It stems from a sense of being out of place, Take my word for it I understand". (43) Jim is the character in the novel who encourages Changez to believe that his good university education and job would be sufficient for him to join American society. With his remarkable personal journey, Jim is the embodiment of the American dream. With his remarkable personal journey, he is the embodiment of the American dream. Jim is constantly telling Changez in their discussions that he, too, comes from radically different living circumstances and therefore that his hard work worth it.

Despite the fact that Jim is a Native American, he was not accepted into society as a child due to his social status. Changez stresses how he did not live in squalor in Lahore; rather, his family in Pakistan has always been affluent and has hired many servants, but both men and women there in family have always helped working. So it's not Changez's social standing that makes him an outsider. Furthermore, the reality that he must demonstrate himself because of his foreign position that harms him. When he describes his vacation in Greece with his former Princeton graduates and thinks about the city wall of Rhodes that protects the city from attackers, Changez claims that he figured he grew up on the other side.

The second time where Changez understands that he was wearing an American mask the entire time and was not a piece of the gathering, of which he considers himself to be a part of and alludes to as 'we' on his first days at Underwood Samson, is the point at which the team leaves from Manila. The 9/11 attacks occur when Changez and his coworkers, including Jim, are on a business trip in Manila. Due to the chaos caused by the horrific incident, the party has been unable to board a plane to the United States following the attack.

Changez was surrounded by armed security guards into a room at the Manila airport and forced to strip down to his boxer shorts, that was one of the instances in which his

Chapter three: the struggle for identity and the question of belonging in *the Reluctant fundamentalist*

American mask is no longer accepted by community. He faces a similar scenario, this time with American border agents as he arrives in New York City, since he did not have an American passport, he was separated from his colleagues and had to wait in the line for foreign visa holders. He is reminded here of not being a part of the social community of which he saw himself as a solid member. After an uncomfortable chat with a harsh police officer and a second search, Changez arrives in the customs hall to discover that his group has already packed their luggage and departed. Despite the fact that Jim had inquired as to whether he was okay on the flight, the unit in which he saw himself as a safe member was unconcerned about Changez's safety at the airport.

Cultural translation is the result of a world that is constantly changing, particularly as a result of globalization. Globalization occurs as a new occurrence that has yet to be identified and must be determined. The challenge for a migrant with this is that the entrance of new world doesn't really correspond to the familiar surroundings. As the globalized world is one in which migration and transnational forms of living are common, migration is a component that contributes to the globalization process (Bhabha, *The Location of Culture* 313).

But does the globalized world allow individuals to live in a state in which they can immigrate to new territories while retaining the cultural heritage they brought with them from their home country? The meeting of these two cultures, namely one's own and that of the newly entered society, can result in the formation of a liminal space. It is necessary to examine the colonial past in order to comprehend the problem of cultural translation. When discussing cultural differences, we frequently encounter the concept of otherness which is the state of being distinct from and alien to a person's social identity and self-identity (Bhabha, *The Location of Culture* 313).

Chapter three: the struggle for identity and the question of belonging in *the Reluctant fundamentalist*

Changez's sense of otherness, which began with the roadside glower with the Filipino man, grows as a result of these incidents. At both airports, he is harassed by the police and accused of violating American standards, Standards that he assimilated while in the United States, as well as standards that he embodied prior to his arrival in the United States by his person identity. As his Islamic identity came into the spotlight, his position in society as a result of his association with Underwood Samson vanished immediately.

Being identified solely as a Muslim rather than as an individual also contributes to the otherness Changez is experiencing in the aftermath of the attacks of 9/11 (Khan 84). His look after 9/11 serves as a warning to his fellow Americans that he is a foreigner in their nation, who is of a threatening region of the globe such as Afghanistan, Pakistan, and Saudi Arabia, which are “associated... with the iniquities of terror, religious extremism, and criminality” in the mainstream American consciousness (Khan 85).

People of diaspora find themselves in an unprecedented circumstance, instead of being instantly approved and well-integrated into the country in which they have immigrated. They quickly form their own communities with people who share a similar habitus, feeling out of place in this part of society (The Location of Culture 199). These newly formed communities are usually found on the outskirts of societies, where they will remain for the rest of their lives. An immigrant's association with people of like mind and fate is much more convenient and easier than entering the new society, which has a few more obstacles. The immigrant remains on the margin of the new society as a coexisting second society alongside the original (The Location of Culture 199).

Marginalization is not always caused by the immigrant himself, but also by society, which denies potential new members entry. Bell Hooks in her book *Feminist Theory: From Margin to Center* explained how immigrants were denied basic necessities that natives take

Chapter three: the struggle for identity and the question of belonging in *the Reluctant fundamentalist*

for granted in their daily lives, and how they were always forced to return to the margin, beyond the tracks, shacks, and abandoned houses on the outskirts of the city. The marginal space in which these people were placed was not chosen by them, but rather resulted from the reality of the politics of the time in which they lived. Marginalisation, according to Iris Marion Young, is the most harmful form of discrimination because it denies marginalized people the mobility in society that their fellow citizens experience.

### **3.3The Question of Identity and Belonging**

Changez had both benefits and drawbacks as a foreigner in the United States up to 9/11. Changez's perspective on the world changes drastically after the World Trade Center attack, now that he has the face of the Muslim terrorist. Hamid reveals the unvarnished truth about Changez's reaction to the bombing when he saw the World Trade Center collapse with a "smile." "Yes, horrific as it might sound, my immediate reaction was to be remarkably pleased,"(72) he tells his American interlocutor in Lahore.

Muhsin Hamid depicts the inner conflict Changez encounters in all its ugliness through Changez's reaction to the 9/11 destruction, revealing the depth of Changez's struggle to belong in the United States while retaining his Pakistani identity. His expression emphasizes the complexities of belonging to two worlds of split loyalties in the two different worlds he inhabits as an American and as a Pakistani. Changez's smile reflects the burden of belonging to a formerly colonized country that, at the time of 9/11, was already dancing to the rhythm of United States imperial policies. His identities are tense, and he is "caught in the symbolism of it all, the fact that someone had so visibly brought America to her knees." (73) Changez, by his own confession, was a "product"(74) of the American system, wherein he gained a "lucrative American salary"(74) and was "obsessed"(74) with an American woman. Since he couldn't comprehend his inner reactions, he kept "hiding" his confused

Chapter three: the struggle for identity and the question of belonging in *the Reluctant fundamentalist*

emotions from his American coworkers, He "pretended"(74) to be shocked and distressed by what he saw around him. His response also reflects the effects of years of colonialism and US imperialism (Sobia Khan 143).

Changez expresses his Otherness at various points in the novel, but his sense of isolation becomes much more intense following 9/11 because he supposedly looks like the terrorists, practices their religion, and comes from the same Muslim world far away. Changez finds himself in unpleasant positions as a result of being mistaken for one of the terrorists. According to Sunaina Maira, "Following 9/11, the War on Terror has resulted in two, largely dichotomous ways of expressing cultural citizenship for Muslim Americans. These are what I refer to as "good" and "poor" Muslim citizenship, based on Mahmood Mamdani's book, *Good Muslim, Bad Muslim: America, the Cold War, and the Roots of Terrorism* " (633).

In the preceding discussion, we saw how Changez is identified and regarded as a foreigner, which only contributes to his difficulty in determining who as well as where he belongs. Changez's identity becomes relevant when he is mistreated because of his appearance, the religion he follows, and the region he is from. Changez's search for identity is a fundamental issue for him since it defines his connection to the world he inhabits. Changez clearly thought he didn't belong in New York or Lahore, despite the fact that he claims to be both a New Yorker and a Pakistani (Sobia Khan 144).

Changez's inability to fit in spreads to his hometown of Lahore. When Changez returns to Pakistan soon after 9/11, he is unable to fit back into the life he had before leaving Lahore to study at Princeton. He cannot stay at his family house, Changez not only felt alienated from American culture and people in New Jersey and New York, but he also feels uncomfortable in his hometown of Lahore. After four years abroad, the "Americanness of

Chapter three: the struggle for identity and the question of belonging in *the Reluctant fundamentalist*

his gaze"(124) shifts how he sees what he once considered his place. He realizes how messy and terribly built his Lahore home is, He observes the ceiling cracks and "dry bubbles of paint flaking off where dampness had infiltrated its walls."(124) He describes, "I felt humiliated. It was where I originated from, my ancestry, and it reeked of ugliness."(124) He recognizes that his surroundings had not changed, yet, as he puts it, "I had changed; I was looking around with the eyes of a foreigner, not just any foreigner, but that particular sort of arrogant and uncompassionate American."(124) His return to home is as painful as his failure to settle in New York.

Changez is torn between two places after 9/11, his affiliations split between his birthplace and the place that shaped him into the man he is. However, when the United States begins bombing Afghanistan, ashes of intense anger begin to develop inside Changez. Changez's personal crisis bursts during a trip to Chile for Underwood Samson; His firm's mission is to determine the worth of a non-profitable publishing business. Juan-Bautista, the business's chief executive officer, is an elderly man who is displeased with the arrival of Underwood Samson to review his publishing house for a potential buyer. Changez is taken with the elderly gentleman who enjoys literature and is fighting a corporate raid on the bookstore he owns. He has a similar appearance to Changez's grandfather which made him like the man, Changez is dissatisfied with his job by this point in the novel, and in the wake of 9/11, he is questioning everything he once believed to be accurate(Sobia Khan 148).

Changez's identity as a Pakistani also develops a profound crisis in the aftermath of 9/11. Changez feels "fury" well inside him as the "Shock and Awe"(128) campaign against Afghanistan starts, but even as he talks himself out of any self responsibility for the events unfolding around him, he sees the "embers"(128) glowing within him. He considers himself a "traitor"(128) for assisting America in subjugating Afghanistan and for leaving his country. He has "contempt"(128) for himself after leaving Pakistan. "I found it ironic:



Chapter three: the struggle for identity and the question of belonging in *the Reluctant fundamentalist*

children and the elderly was supposed to be sent away from imminent wars, but in our situation, it was the bravest and youngest who were departing, those who would have been supposed to stay,"(129) he says.

Changez is perplexed as to why he is "abandoning"(128) his family and hometown. Juan-Bautista draws a connection to his own experience with janissaries. He describes that janissaries were "Christian boys ... captured by the Ottomans and trained to be soldiers in a Muslim army, at that time the greatest army in the world. They were ferocious and utterly loyal: they had fought to erase their own civilizations, so they had nothing else to turn to"(151), Changez realizes he has become a janissary contributing for the destruction of his own people. He observes his society's inversion, in which the best and brightest were sent to the West while the rest were left behind to fight everyday battles.

Changez's identity crisis is transformed when he understands his position and job in America as that of a contemporary janissary, "a slave of the American economy at a time when it was occupying a nation with closeness to mine."(152) He is confronted with concerns of belonging and allegiance to America, where he gained his education, employed for a profitable business, and paid a very higher income, while also questioning his commitment to Pakistan, his homeland, in which his family lives, as well as where he strives for tea and a rich historical history.

The 9/11 attacks act as a watershed moment in Changez's fraught relationship with America, as he starts to see himself as an unwanted foreigner and his loyalty to Underwood Samson as that of a contemporary janissary. His company's handling of Juan Bautista and the publishing house in Chile solidifies his choice to abandon Underwood Samson. His relationship with America comes to an end, and so does his employment for Underwood

Chapter three: the struggle for identity and the question of belonging in *the Reluctant fundamentalist*

Samson. Changez's friendship with Juan-Bautista, a man who favors books over benefit and moral ties over financial ties, proves invaluable and influences his life path.

### **3.4 Asserting Muslim Identity**

Changez resolves his identity dilemma in the novel by embracing an externally "genuine" Pakistani Muslim identity. He expresses his religion by altering his look. The novel's first and final scenes show that Changez's major concern is the issue of identity. He grows a beard at the end of the novel to assert his Islamic and Pakistani identity after 9/11, in contrast to his earlier clean-shaven appearance as a student and worker in America. He goes back to Pakistan and starts working as a university lecturer, making it his "mission on campus to advocate a disengagement from your country by mine," (179) as he states to the American guest. His campus following and protests became newsworthy and branded as "anti-American." (182) Changez clearly takes pride in his work as he tells the American stranger about his new life in Lahore. He and his supporters refer to themselves as "comrades," (182) and he sees his anti-American campaign as an effort to "transcend the barriers between continents and cultures."

In response to "increased and multifaceted discrimination in the post 9/11 period," Baljit Nagra emphasizes the importance of "theorizing the formation of Muslim identity." (438) His study focussed on how Muslims returned to their religion with renewed enthusiasm in reaction to discrimination following the World Trade Center attack. He refers to this shift toward a revived sense of Islamic identity as the product of "reactive identity formation." He coined the term reactive identity creation to make sense of Muslim experiences post-9/11 and highlight the difficulty involved in the formation of reactive identities, expanding the work of other sociologists on "reactive ethnicity." He argues that Muslims develop a new reactive identity as a method of relieving with discrimination, as a

Chapter three: the struggle for identity and the question of belonging in *the Reluctant fundamentalist*

form of resistance to discrimination, and as a catalyst for learning more about their religion, Islam. According to Nagra's findings, "people develop reactive identities when any of those aspects of their identity is outlined and questioned,"(438) aspects like race, gender, class, religion, sexuality, and age.

## General Conclusion

The aim of this study was to demonstrate the difficulties that Hybrid-Muslim Americans face in the aftermath of 9/11. With the aid of two novels, I was able to capture various facets of the lives of two Pakistani-American men. Both stories are fictional, but it is worth noting that their writers, Mohsin Hamid and Ali Eteraz, are both of Pakistani descent, and they both lived between Pakistan and America and are aware of both cultures, so the characters' points of view are automatically more genuine. The theoretical framework I provided on Postcolonial Literature theory was adequate for determining which aspects of the novels I wanted to concentrate on.

The discrimination that the protagonists were subjected to has influenced how each one of them has lived his life. Changez's life in America crumbled after the suicide of the girl he loved, and he knew there was nothing else of value there. The discrimination Changez faced following 9/11, reinforced his misplacement in The United States, and with the assistance of Juan-Bautista who helped him realizing that he was nothing more than a modern day janissary to America, he is empowered to quit his job, leave the United States and return to his homeland.

Changez's cultural hybridity helps him to see both cultures side by side. Politics, however, distorts and influences it. Changez tries to stay in the middle, but his personal, social, and political experiences force him to take a drastic stance. But It is obvious from the way he talks as an elder that he has not let go of his past in the United States, as he continues to receive the Princeton Alumni Weekly. The novel's end does not provide a straightforward response as to what happens next, leaving the reader to fill in the blanks.

Contrastingly, M does not have the option of returning to his native country after his firing, alienation, and marginalization because of his Muslim identity. He prefers instead to

## General Conclusion

show his society that he chooses to be a member of the American society. He was assimilated into America prior to George Gabriel's discriminating act, however, he felt compelled to reinforce his ties to America by impregnating his American wife. And since his wife cannot have children, He uses the State Department Program, which he became a member of due to Mahmoud's assistance, as a rostrum to show America that he is on her side by marketing the picture of a happy and harmonious life for Muslims in the United States, and by telling the world that America is the most suitable place for multiculturalism.

Throughout my dissertation, I noticed that each character comes from a different social, economic, and family background, and as a result, each of them has a different attitude toward their own hybridity. I have examined both Changez and M's experiences, I discovered that M chose to be a member of the American society and threw the Quran into the river as a symbol of abandoning his Islamic identity, while Changez chose to leave America, travel back to Pakistan, and assert his muslim identity. That was the most significant difference between Changez and M, who have a similar background since they are both Pakistani Americans. M wants to be a part of the American culture and is attempting to assimilate, while Changez prefers to be a part of his homeland.

Finally, I believe that the reason for writing these stories is the increased discrimination against Muslim Americans as a result of the 9/11 attacks. Ali Eteraz and Muhsin Hamid emphasized how the United States is made up of diverse cultures, nationalities, and identities that must find a way to coexist and find a common ground. I hope that my analysis of the novels will open up new doors for other researchers to work on.

## Works cited

- Abu-Ras, W., F. Senzai, and L. Laird. 2013. American Muslim Physicians' Experiences Since 9/11: Cultural Trauma and the Formation of Islamic Identity. *Traumatology* 19 (1): 11–19.
- Ahmed, Yahia. Mowjiz Tarikh Al Islam Fi America. Sasa post. Feb 1, 2017. 15:04. [sasapost.com/translation/short-history-islam-in-america/](http://sasapost.com/translation/short-history-islam-in-america/)
- Al Sinou, Mohammed. Hal Al Islam Din Siyasa. Al Hiwar Al Motamadin. Sep 23. 2011.17:02 [ahewar.org/debat/show.art.asp?aid=276709](http://ahewar.org/debat/show.art.asp?aid=276709)
- Alsultany, E. 2007. Selling American Diversity and Muslim American Identity Through Nonprofit Advertising Post-9/11. *American Quarterly* 59 (3): 593–622.
- Ashcroft, Bill, Gareth Griffith, Hellen Tiffin. *Post-Colonial Studies: The Key Concepts*. London: Routledge, 2013.
- Ashmore, R.D., K. Deaux, and T. McLaughlin-Volpe. 2004. An Organizing Framework for Collective Identity: Articulation and Significance of Multidimensionality. *Psychological Bulletin* 130: 80–114.
- Bhabha, Homi. "The Third Space". Interview by Jonathan Rutherford. *Identity. Community, Culture, Difference*, edited by Rutherford. London: Lawrence & Wishart, 1998, pp. 207-221.
- Bhabha, Homi. Foreword. *The Wretched of the Earth*, by Frantz Fanon, 1961, Grove Press, 2004, pp. vii-xli.
- Bhabha, Homi. *The Location of Culture*. New York City: Routledge, 1994.
- Carter, Michael J., Danielle C. Mireles. "Identity Theory." *The Blackwell Encyclopedia of Sociology*, edited by George Ritzer, 2015. *Blackwell Pub.*, Online.
- Casey, P.M. 2017. Stigmatized Identities: Too Muslim to Be American, Too American to Be Muslim. *Symbolic Interaction* 41 (1): 100–119.
- Çelik, Ç. 2015. 'Having a German Passport Will Not Make Me German': Reactive Ethnicity and Oppositional Identity Among Disadvantaged Male Turkish Second-Generation Youth in Germany. *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 38 (9): 1646–1662.

- Cheek, Jonathan M. (1989). "Identity Orientations and Self-Interpretation". In Buss, David Michael; Cantor, Nancy (eds.). *Personality Psychology: Recent Trends and Emerging Directions* (reprint ed.). New York: Springer Science & Business Media (published 2012). p. 341. doi:10.1007/978-1-4684-0634-4\_21. ISBN 9781468406344.
- Courty, Audrey. Rane, Halim. "Why the media needs to be more responsible for how it links Islam and Islamist terrorism". *The conversation*. Oct 1, 2018. [theconversation.com/why-the-media-needs-to-be-more-responsible-for-how-it-links-islam-and-islamist-terrorism-103170](http://theconversation.com/why-the-media-needs-to-be-more-responsible-for-how-it-links-islam-and-islamist-terrorism-103170)
- Erikson, E.H. 1968. *Identity: Youth and Crisis*. New York, NY: W. W. Norton and Company.
- Eteraz, Ali. "Announcing the debut novel by Ali Eteraz". Ali Eteraz. Apr 7, 2016. [alietiraz.com/post/142400344961/announcing-the-debut-novel-by-ali-eteraz](http://alietiraz.com/post/142400344961/announcing-the-debut-novel-by-ali-eteraz).
- Fanon, Frantz. *Black Skin, White Masks*. New York: Grove Press, 1968.
- Fanon, Frantz. *The Wretched of the Earth*. New York: Grove Press. 2004.
- Fish, M.S. 2011. *Are Muslims Distinctive?: A Look at the Evidence*. New York, NY: OUP.
- Green, Emma. "How America Is Transforming Islam: Being young and Muslim in the U.S. means navigating multiple identities. Nothing shows that more than falling in love." *The Atlantic*. dec 31, 2017. [theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2017/12/muslims-assimilation-weddings/549230/](http://theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2017/12/muslims-assimilation-weddings/549230/)
- Holloway, David. 9/11 and the War on Terror. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2008. "I am an American." The Advertising Council. 2001–present. 15 Feb. 2010  
(<http://www.adcouncil.org/default.aspx?id=141>).
- Haddad, Y.Y. 2007. The Post-9/11 Hijab as Icon. *Sociology of Religion* 68 (3): 253–267.
- Hamish Hamilton Ltd, Mohsin Hamid Fiction. William Morris Agency (UK). [mohsinhamid.com](http://mohsinhamid.com)
- James, Paul (2015). "Despite the Terrors of Typologies: The Importance of Understanding Categories of Difference and Identity". *Interventions: International Journal of Postcolonial Studies*. 17 (2): 174–195. doi:10.1080/1369801X.2014.993332. S2CID 142378403.

- Kearns, E. M., Betus, A. E., & Lemieux, A. F. (2019). Why Do Some Terrorist Attacks Receive More Media Attention Than Others? *Justice Quarterly*, 1–24.
- Kennedy, Valerie. "Changez/Cengiz's Changing Beliefs in The Reluctant Fundamentalist." CLCWeb: Comparative Literature and Culture 20.6 (2018): <https://doi.org/10.7771/1481-4374.3321>
- Khan, Gohar Karim. "The Treatment of '9/11' in Contemporary Anglophone Pakistani Literature: Mohsin Hamid's The Reluctant Fundamentalist as a Postcolonial Bildungsroman." *eSharp*, no. Nov, 2011, pp. 84-104.
- Khan, M. 2000. Muslims and identity politics in America. In *Muslims on the Americanization Path?*, ed. J.L. Esposito and Y. Haddad, 87–101. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Khan, Sobia. (2015) Alienated Muslim Identity in the Post-9/11 America: A Transnational Study of *The Reluctant Fundamentalist*, *South Asian Review*, 36:3, 141-160, DOI: 10.1080/02759527.2015.11933039
- Kunst, J.R., H. Tajamal, D.L. Sam, and P. Ulleberg. 2012. Coping with Islamophobia: The Effects of Religious Stigma on Muslim Minorities' Identity Formation. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations* 36 (4): 518–532.
- Kut, Fatma. "Hybrid-Muslim Identity and Islamophobia in Post-9/11 US American Literature. U of Der Johannes Gutenberg. Master dissertation.
- Lemsine, Aicha. Muslim Scholars Face Down Fanaticism. *Washington Report on Middle East Affairs*, June 1995, pp 17, 92. Jun 14,1995.
- Love, Erik. *Islamophobia and Racism in America*. New York: New York University Press, 2017.
- Maira, Sunaina. "'Good' and 'Bad' Muslim Citizens: Feminists, Terrorists, and U.S. Orientalisms." *Feminist Studies* 35.3 (Fall 2009): 631-656. EBSCO. Web. Aug 10, 2015.
- McGinty, A.M. 2012. The 'Mainstream Muslim' Opposing Islamophobia: Self-Representations of American Muslims. *Environment and Planning A* 44 (12): 2953–2957.



- Mills, A., and B. Gökarıksel. 2014. Provincializing Geographies of Religion: Muslim Identities Beyond the 'West'. *Geography Compass* 8 (12): 902–914.
- Mir, S. 2009. Not Too "College-Like," Not Too Normal: American Muslim Undergraduate Women's Gendered Discourses. *Anthropology and Education Quarterly* 40 (3): 237–256
- Mir, S. 2011. 'Just to Make Sure People Know I Was Born Here': Muslim Women Constructing American Selves. *Discourse Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education* 32 (4): 547–563.
- Mishra, S., and F. Shirazi. 2010. Hybrid Identities: American Muslim Women Speak. *Gender, Place and Culture: A Journal of Feminist Geography* 17 (2): 191–209.
- Muedini, F. 2009. Muslim American College Youth: Attitudes and Responses Five Years After 9/11. *Muslim World* 99 (1): 39–59.
- Nagra, Baljit. "Our Faith Was Also Hijacked by Those People': Reclaiming Muslim Identity in Canada in a Post-9/11 Era." *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 37.3 (2011): 425-41. EBSCO. Web. 10 Aug 2015.
- Naimal, Fatima. *The Pakistani Diaspora in North America*. CIMRAD Working Paper No. 02-18. Graduate Institute of Development Studies Lahore School of Economics, Nov 2018.
- Nishat Haider (2012) Globalization, US Imperialism and Fundamentalism: A Study of Mohsin Hamid's *The Reluctant Fundamentalist*, *South Asian Review*, 33:2, 203-238, DOI: 10.1080/02759527.2012.11932885
- Peek, L. 2005. Becoming Muslim: The Development of a Religious Identity. *Sociology of Religion* 66 (3): 215–242.
- Quratulain, Shirazi. (2018) Ambivalent identities and liminal spaces: reconfiguration of national and diasporic identity in Mohsin Hamid's *The Reluctant Fundamentalist*, *South Asian Diaspora*, 10:1, 15-29, DOI: 10.1080/19438192.2017.1396013
- Rad Diaspora Profile. The Pakistanis diaspora in the United States. Migration policy institute. Jun. 2015.

- Rosenthal, Ingrid. "Our Namesake: How Edward Said Empowers Us to Reclaim "Other"". Other collective. Jan 24, 2019. [othercollective.org/our-namesake-how-edward-said-empowers-us-to-reclaim-other/](http://othercollective.org/our-namesake-how-edward-said-empowers-us-to-reclaim-other/)
- Said, Edward C. *Orientalism*. London: Penguin, 2003.
- Salmeen, A. S. (2019). The Reluctant Fundamentalist: Hybridity and the Struggle for Identity. *International Journal of Liberal Arts and Social Science*, 7(3), 31-37.
- Samad, A.Y. (2012). Pakistani Diaspora in the UK and USA. In: South Asian Diaspora by Chatterji, J. and Washbrook, D. (Eds.). Routledge.
- Shaheen, J.G. 2001. (2001/2003 abridged). Reel Bad Arabs: How Hollywood Vilifies a People. *The Annals of the American Academy* 588: 171–193.
- Sirin, S.R., and M. Fine. 2007. Hyphenated Selves: Muslim American Youth Negotiating Their Identities Across the Fault Lines of Global Conflict. *Applied Developmental Science* 11 (3): 151–163.
- Sirin, Selcuk, et al. "Exploring Dual Identification among Muslim-American Emerging Adults: A mixed Methods Study." *Journal of Adolescence*, vol. 31, no. 2, 2008, pp. 259-279.
- Smart, Julie (2011). "Erikson's Psychosocial Theory of Human Development". Disability Across the Developmental Life Span: For the Rehabilitation Counselor. Springer Publishing Company. p. 86. ISBN 9780826107350.
- Tabbah, R., J.J. Chung, and A.H. Miranda. 2016. Ethnic Identity and Discrimination: An Exploration of the Rejection-Identification Model in Arab American Adolescents. *Identity* 16 (4): 319–334.
- Tronto, Joan. "Frantz Fanon." *Contemporary Political Theory*, vol. 3, 2004, pp. 245-252.
- William E. Shepard; FranÇois Burgat; James Piscatori; Armando Salvatore (2009). "Islamism". In John L. Esposito (ed.). *The Oxford Encyclopedia of the Islamic World*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. [ISBN 9780195305135](https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780195305135).
- Williams, Jennifer. "A brief history of Islam in America: Islam's roots in America go back to the Founding Fathers." Vox. Jan 29, 2017. [vox.com/2015/12/22/10645956/islam-in-america](http://vox.com/2015/12/22/10645956/islam-in-america).

- Zaman, S. 2008. From Imam to Cyber-Mufti: Consuming Identity in Muslim America. *Muslim World* 98 (4): 465–474.
- Zeidan, Adam. “Islamism: political ideologies.” Encyclopedia Britannica. Mar 4, 2020. [britannica.com/topic/Islamism](https://www.britannica.com/topic/Islamism).

## Abstract

The object of this study is to examine elements of hybridity in two novels; Ali Eteraz' *Native Believer* and Muhsin Hamid' *The Reluctant Fundamentalist*. These two novels feature two protagonists who are either first-generation or second-generation Muslim migrants in the United States and are both of Pakistani descent. 9/11 plays a significant role in both novels, as this historical event marked a watershed moment in the lives of many Muslims in the United States and around the world. So I examine and analyze the various ways in which Pakistani Muslim migrants negotiate their hybrid identities as depicted in Muhsin Hamid's and Ali Eteraz's novels. I will analyse how 9/11 has altered the way Muslims are perceived, treated, and how they lived their lives in the light of that all. I will also examine how each one of them explore his identity and what he will end up doing as a result.

Keywords: identity, identity crisis, hybridity, Pakistanis muslims, 9/11, islam, Pakistan, The United States.

## Résumé

L'objet de cette étude est d'examiner des éléments d'hybridité dans deux romans ; *Le croyant natif* d'Ali Eteraz et *le fondamentaliste réticent* de Muhsin Hamid. Ces deux romans mettent en scène deux protagonistes qui sont soit des migrants musulmans de première ou de deuxième génération aux États-Unis et tous deux d'origine pakistanaise. Le 11 septembre joue un rôle important dans les deux romans, car cet événement historique a marqué un tournant dans la vie de nombreux musulmans aux États-Unis et dans le monde. J'examine et analyse donc les différentes manières dont les migrants musulmans pakistanaïes négocient leurs identités hybrides, telles qu'elles sont décrites dans les romans de Muhsin Hamid et Ali Eteraz. J'analyserai comment le 11 septembre a modifié la façon dont les musulmans sont perçus, traités et comment ils ont vécu leur vie à la lumière de tout cela. J'examinerai également comment chacun d'entre eux explore son identité et ce qu'il finira par en faire.

Mots-clés : identité, crise identitaire, hybridité, musulmans pakistanaïes, 11 septembre, islam, Pakistan, États-Unis.

## التلخيص

الهدف من هذه الدراسة هو فحص عناصر التهجين في روايتين. *المؤمن الأصلي* لـ علي اتراز و *الأصولي المتردد* لـ محسن حميد. تحتوي هاتان الروايتان على بطلين إما من الجيل الأول أو الجيل الثاني من المهاجرين المسلمين في الولايات المتحدة وكلاهما من أصل باكستاني. تلعب أحداث الحادي عشر من سبتمبر دورًا مهمًا في كلتا الروايتين، حيث مثل هذا الحدث التاريخي لحظة فاصلة في حياة العديد من المسلمين في الولايات المتحدة وحول العالم. لذلك قمت بفحص وتحليل الطرق المختلفة التي يتفاوض بها المهاجرون الباكستانيون المسلمون على هوياتهم الهجينة كما هو موضح في روايات محسن حميد وعلي اتراز. سأحلل كيف غيرت أحداث الحادي عشر من سبتمبر الطريقة التي يُنظر بها إلى المسلمين، ويعاملون، وكيف عاشوا حياتهم في ضوء كل ذلك. سأدرس أيضًا كيف يستكشف كل واحد منهم هويته وما الذي سيفعله نتيجة لذلك.

الكلمات المفتاحية: الهوية، أزمة الهوية، التهجين، الباكستانيون المسلمون، 11/9، الإسلام، باكستان، الولايات المتحدة.